



# AL-A'RAF

Jurnal Pemikiran Islam dan Filsafat

<https://ejournal.uinsaid.ac.id/index.php/al-araf>

ISSN: 1693-9867 (p); 2527-5119 (e)

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.22515/ajpif.v17i2.2761>



## RESISTED VERSUS FASCINATED: THE MUSLIM-CHRISTIAN RELATIONSHIP IN THE POST-REGIONAL AUTONOMY IN PADANG, WEST SUMATERA

**Andri Ashadi**

Universitas Islam Negeri Imam Bonjol, Padang

**Nurus Shalihin**

Universitas Islam Negeri Imam Bonjol, Padang

### *Abstrak*

#### **Kata Kunci:**

Hubungan  
Muslim-Kristen;  
Adaptasi;  
Perlawanan;  
Sekolah

*Keterlibatan peserta didik beragama Kristen dalam program-program di sekolah Islam, seperti mengenakan busana Muslim, mengikuti kegiatan ceramah (keagamaan) tujuh menit, dan mengikuti pembelajaran agama Islam seringkali dianggap sebagai bentuk sikap kepatuhan. Padahal, ini merupakan proses adaptasi diri mereka, karena bersekolah di lingkungan mayoritas Muslim. Kamouflase ini justru dapat dipahami sebagai representasi perlawanan mereka terhadap aturan sekolah. Artikel ini membahas bagaimana peserta didik beragama Kristen di dua sekolah negeri di Padang berperilaku dalam kerangka adat istiadat Islam. Dengan perspektif teori simulacra Jean Baudrillard dan teori perlawanan James C. Scott, hasil studi menunjukkan, bahwa peserta didik beragama Kristen di dua sekolah negeri tersebut cenderung taat, bahkan tertarik pada praktik agama Islam. Sebagai contoh, perilaku mereka dalam meniru cara berpakaian peserta didik Muslim agar terlibat mirip dengan peserta didik Muslim. Sikap ini menyenangkan hati para guru Muslim dan sesama peserta didik. Bahkan, masyarakat Minang di lingkungannya juga takjub dan selalu menyebut sikap peserta didik tersebut sebagai teladan untuk diikuti.*

Received:  
11 April 2020

Revised:  
21 September 2020

Accepted:  
30 November 2020

Published Online:  
30 December 2020

Corresponding author:

e-mail: [andriashadi@uinib.ac.id](mailto:andriashadi@uinib.ac.id)

© 2020 UIN Raden Mas Said Surakarta

---

**Abstract**

**Keywords:**  
Muslim-Christian relationship;  
Adaptation;  
Resistance;  
School

---

Christian students' involvement in the school Islamic programs such as wearing Muslim clothing, participating in the seven-minute Islamic sermon, and joining Islamic classes are often considered a compliance attitude. Instead, it is a process of self-adaptation because they attend a school within a Muslim majority environment. Moreover, this camouflage represents their resistance to the school rules. This article discusses how Christian students in two state schools in Padang behave in the framework of Islamic customs. Based on the theories of Jean Baudrillard's simulacra and James C. Scott's resistance, the results of this study show that Christian students in two state schools in Padang tend to be obedient and interested in Islamic practices. For instance, they imitate the way Muslim students dress so that they look similar to Muslim students. This attitude pleases their Muslim teachers and fellow students. In addition, Minang people in their neighborhood also amaze and always refer to these Christian students' attitude as a model to be followed.

## Introduction

Muslims and Christians in Indonesia have been encountering for centuries a broad spectrum of life, from the political aspect and power relation to social and cultural dimensions. These encounters sometimes occur in tension, suspicion, or even conflict. However, the mutual and peaceful dialogue still dominates in Muslim-Christian relationship.<sup>1</sup>

In the context of politics and power relation, Arifianto finds that the root of tension and suspicion between Muslims and Christians in Indonesia mostly happen on the issue of Islamization versus Christianization.<sup>2</sup> Meanwhile, Al-Qurtuby emphasizes that the diversity, complexity, and dynamics of Christian-Muslim group relations especially in Maluku, apart from being significantly determined by the historical process of polarization, purification including Christianization and Islamization, are also exacerbated by the emergence of divisions within Muslim and Christian groups, such as Muslim Jihadists and Christian

---

<sup>1</sup> Jan S. Aritonang, *Sejarah Perjumpaan Kristen dan Islam di Indonesia* (Jakarta: Gunung Mulia, 2006).

<sup>2</sup> Alexander R. Arifianto, "Explaining the Cause of Muslim-Christian Conflicts in Indonesia: Tracing the Origins of Kristenisasi and Islamisasi," *Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations* 20, no. 1 (January 21, 2009): 73–89, <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/09596410802542144>.

Fighter.<sup>3</sup> Damayanti provides evidence of the restrictions, vandalism, and prohibition of the construction of places of worship which occurred in Bandung, Bekasi, and Bogor. Also, Chang-Yau Hoon argues that some urban Christians participate in politics and social activism as a counterweight to the Islamization movement and religious intolerance in Indonesia.<sup>4</sup> These issues are perceived as threat and suspicion about Christianization and the establishment of an Islamic state.<sup>5</sup> Therefore, Feener traces the competition and conflict between Muslims and Christians from the 16<sup>th</sup> to the 21<sup>st</sup> Centuries to find some deeper perspectives on the social, cultural, and political impact on the competition between the two communities.<sup>6</sup>

On the other hand, in the socio-cultural context, King argues on the significance of music performance as a medium for dialogue and peace between Muslims and Christians in Turkey, Beirut, Lebanon, Morocco, and Indonesia as well.<sup>7</sup> Myengkkyo shows that the Javanese Christian Church (GKJ) found a strong foothold in Muslim society by sharing spaces with al-Hikmah Mosque in Surakarta, Central Java.<sup>8</sup> Sumbulah notes that in the Reformation Era the portrait of Muslim-Christian relations seems more harmonious. Shee offers evidence of increased

---

<sup>3</sup> Sumanto Al Qurtuby, "Ambonese Muslim Jihadists, Islamic Identity, and The History of Christian-Muslim Rivalry in The Moluccas, Eastern Indonesia," *International Journal of Asian Studies* 12, no. 1 (January 28, 2015): 1–29.

<sup>4</sup> Myengkkyo Seo, "Missions Without Missionaries: The Social Dimension of Church Growth in Muslim Java, Indonesia," *Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations* 24, no. 1 (January 2013): 71–89, <http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/09596410.2013.745300>.

<sup>5</sup> Angel Damayanti, "Muslim-Christian Relationships in Indonesian Reform Era Within The Framework of Democracy: Case Study of Bandung, Bekasi and Bogor (1998-2015)," in *Proceedings of the Third International Conference on Social and Political Sciences (ICSPS 2017)* (Paris, France: Atlantis Press, 2018), 9–18, <http://www.atlantis-press.com/php/paper-details.php?id=25891323>.

<sup>6</sup> R. Michael Feener, "Religious Competition and Conflict Over The Longue Durée: Christianity and Islam in The Indonesian Archipelago," *Asian Journal of Religion and Society* 5, no. 1 (2017): 1–22.

<sup>7</sup> Roberta R. King, "Music, Peacebuilding, and Interfaith Dialogue: Transformative Bridges in Muslim-Christian Relations," *International Bulletin of Mission Research* 40, no. 3 (July 18, 2016): 202–217, <http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1177/2396939316636884>.

<sup>8</sup> Myengkkyo Seo, "Missions Without Missionaries: The Social Dimension of Church Growth in Muslim Java, Indonesia."

interreligious awareness and cooperation in various aspects of life, and a more tolerant, inclusive, and harmonious theological reconstruction in Peniwen Village, Malang, East Java.<sup>9</sup> Meanwhile, Zulkarnain, Samsuri, and Hutagalung show that group leaders play a major role in building religious tolerance through the leadership of three *Tungku*, namely religious leaders, traditional leaders, and government in East Nusa Tenggara.<sup>10</sup>

Even though the above picture is hard to avoid, but it does not necessarily represent the relation between Muslim-Christian in Indonesia. The religious social relationship seems to be more complicated than just a picture of conflict or integration. In contemporary religious studies, the relation may experience border-crossing, fluidity, hybridity, and ambiguity.<sup>11</sup> Even in the political and power relation contexts, not merely all about conflict. This article will provide a picture of that by taking locus in two public schools in Padang City.<sup>12</sup> Non-Muslim students (Christian) in a small population number “have to adapt” by dressing the way Muslim students dress, such as wearing a hijab. They have no choice about the school uniform, but to obey the rule. It is also to create no difference between themselves and their Muslim majority schoolmates. As the effect, it establishes ambivalence, in which on one side, it is obedience since they need to adapt. However, on the other hand, using the perspective of resistance by James Scott, this paper argues that “the adjustment” is no

---

<sup>9</sup> Umi Sumbullah, “Muslim-Christian Relation on the Basis of Christian Village in Malang, East Java, Indonesia : Socio-Theological Reconstruction for Building Religious Harmony,” *Research on Humanities and Social Sciences* 6, no. 12 (2016): 1–7.

<sup>10</sup> Zulkarnain Zulkarnain and Samsuri Samsuri, “Religious Leaders and Indonesian Religious Harmony,” in *Proceedings of the Annual Civic Education Conference (ACEC 2018) Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research, Vol. 251* (Paris, France: Atlantis Press, 2018), <https://www.atlantis-press.com/article/25905915>.

<sup>11</sup> Zainal Abidin Bagir et al., *Studi Agama Di Indonesia: Refleksi Pengalaman* (Yogyakarta: CRCS (Center for Religious and Cross-cultural Studies), 2015).

<sup>12</sup> The basic sources of this article are originated from two research results about the daily experiences of Christian students in Muslim-majority neighborhoods both at school (SMAN 6 and SMKN 2 Padang city) and in their homes. In the academic year of 2014/2015, this school has 829 students, 809 among them are Muslim and 20 students are Christian (4.1%) (Brief History of SMA N 6 Padang, on May 2014). Meanwhile, SMKN 2 has a total of 1182 students registered in July 2014, 26 of them are Christian (Recapitulation of students' number in July 2014 in SMKN 2 Padang).

more than a resistance since they are not Muslim. Even if the resistance is in the hidden transcript; small-scale incidental activities that are irregular, not systemic, and occur individually, opportunistically, and selfishly, without revolutionary consequences, and accommodation to the system of domination.<sup>13</sup>

Strangely, their Muslim clothing looks more convincing, hence this creates a particular fascination in which finally they tend to be the role model for the entire school. Even though this relationship involves real signs (facts) and pseudo signs (images). In a simulated culture, factual reality and images intertwine and mingle or accumulate so that there is no longer a clear distinction between what is real, what is fake, and what is pseudo.<sup>14</sup> This paper will discuss; the form of the resistance in obedience; and the response of their neighborhood, particularly school toward this issue.

### From a Plural City to a Syari'ah City

After Palembang and Medan, Padang is the third-largest city in the Sumatera region and the ninth-largest area in Indonesia.<sup>15</sup> It has 11 districts and 104 sub-districts with a population of 914.968 people in 2016<sup>16</sup>. Formerly, Padang was only a small village, Kampung Batang located on the edge of Batang Arau, Padang City.<sup>17</sup> This city has been the destination of Minang nomads who originate from *Darek* (plateau in Minangkabau) around the 16<sup>th</sup> or the 17<sup>th</sup> Century.<sup>18</sup> They work as fish anglers, salt farmers, an intermediary trader between gold miners and inland pepper

<sup>13</sup> James C. Scott, *Senjatanya Orang-Orang yang Kalah*, Terjemahan. (Jakarta: Yayasan Obor Indonesia, 2000).

<sup>14</sup> Akhyar Lubis, *Postmodernisme: Teori dan Praktek* (Jakarta: PT Grafindo Persada, 2014).

<sup>15</sup> Faisal Ashar, Dilanthi Amaratunga, and Richard Haigh, "The Analysis of Tsunami Vertical Shelter in Padang City," in *4th International Conference on Building Resilience*,

<sup>16</sup> Diskominfo, "Gambaran Umum Kota Padang," *Padang.Go.Id*, last modified 2016, <https://www.padang.go.id/gambaran-umum-kota-padang> (accessed Januari 08, 2017).

<sup>17</sup> Mina Elfira, "Inter-Ethnic Relations in Padang of West Sumatra Navigating Between Assimilation and Exclusivity," *Wacana: Journal of the Humanities of Indonesia* 13, no. 2 (October 1, 2011): 293–304, <http://wacana.ui.ac.id/index.php/wjhi/article/view/25>

<sup>18</sup> Rusli Amran, *Sumatra Barat hingga Plakat Panjang* (Jakarta: Penerbit Sinar Harapan, 1981).

growers with the foreign trader when Padang was one of the important maritime route from China to India via the Malacca Strait.<sup>19</sup> From that small village, they move and build new dwellings such as Alang Laweh, Ranah, Parak Gadang, and Ganting in which later these would be the pioneer of Padang City.<sup>20</sup> As mentioned previously, Alang Lawas is of important vital residence in the colonial era and at the beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> century which is also known as Kaum Tua movement fortress with Mesjid Raya Ganting as the base.<sup>21</sup>

As the entrance and exit of the port, Padang is not only attracted Minang ethnic but other ethnicities as well.<sup>22</sup> Freek Colombijn claimed that Acehnese is the first foreigner to come to this city. They make Padang City the second port to monopolize the supply of pepper and gold derived from inland Minangkabau.<sup>23</sup> Although Aceh people were driven out when VOC opened trading posts in the mid-17<sup>th</sup> Century; however, their feudality values influenced Minang community who resided in Padang coastal area. Aceh people left the inheritance of the “small kings” through a typical knighthood, Commander and Rich Man (*Rang Kayo*) or *Sutan* and *Puti* (princess), occupy the first strata in the society. In the other part, the title, such as *Marah* and *Siti* are the second layer, which refers to blood relations or bloodlines. This matter brings up the slogan of *darek* (interior highlands in Minangkabau) has headman, *rantau* (overseas area) has a king.<sup>24</sup> The other important ethnics are Indian people, *Kling*, and Arabian people. Indians are among the earliest ethnic groups coming to Padang,

---

<sup>19</sup> Freek Colombijn, *Paco-Paco (Kota) Padang: Sejarah sebuah Kota di Indonesia pada Abad Ke-20 dan Penggunaan Ruang Kota* (Yogyakarta: Ombak, 2006).

<sup>20</sup> Rusli Amran, *Sumatra Barat hingga Plakat Panjang*, 313; Mestika Zed, *Kota Padang Tempo Doeloe (Zaman Kolonial), Seri Manuskrip No. 04* (Padang: Pusat Kajian Sosial Budaya dan Ekonomi Fakultas Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial UNP, 2009), 5; Jeffrey Hadler, *Sengketa Tiada Putus: Matriarkat, Reformisme Islam, dan Kolonialisme di Minangkabau*, ed. Samsudin Berlian, Terjemahan. (Menteng: Freedom Institute, 2010), xxiii–xxix.

<sup>21</sup> Mestika Zed, *Kota Padang Tempo Doeloe (Zaman Kolonial), Seri Manuskrip No. 04*, 8.

<sup>22</sup> Edwin M Loeb, *Sumatra: Its History and People* (England: Oxford University Press, 1972), 98.

<sup>23</sup> Freek Colombijn, *Paco-Paco (Kota) Padang: Sejarah Sebuah Kota di Indonesia pada Abad ke-20 dan Penggunaan Ruang Kota*, 57.

<sup>24</sup> Mestika Zed, *Kota Padang Tempo Doeloe (Zaman Kolonial), Seri Manuskrip No. 04*, 12.

around the 9<sup>th</sup> Century AD, although more were recorded at the end of the 18<sup>th</sup> Century, the period of British transitional power in Padang. They were relatively integrated with the Minang community since most of them are Muslim. They live in their very own village called *Kling* Village with their famous Masjid, *Muhammadan*. Meanwhile, immigrants from the Arabic country entered Padang City via the Siak Kingdom in the pre-VOC period. Similar to *Kling* People, religious factors contributed positively toward their relationship with the local community, the Minangkabau community. The Netherlands has exploited this good relationship as a strategy of negotiations with Paderi Community, which resulted in the capture of Tuanku Imam Bonjol.<sup>25</sup>

Padang fully gained the characteristics of a city, such as a society consisting of various tribes when the Dutch occupied it. In addition to making Padang as its headquarters and fortress, the Dutch then established a trading post (VOC).<sup>26</sup> This trading company planned to bring Europeans (Dutch), Chinese, and Nias people to this city.<sup>27</sup> In contrast to the two previous ethnic groups, the relation of the Minang people with the three last-mentioned ethnic groups is relatively distant. According to the classic Furnivall pattern.<sup>28</sup> Europeans mostly settled in the center of the city, close to government offices, markets, and schools were exclusively separated from the local community (Minang) as third-class citizens. They are a small minority but the most powerful. For them, along with other ethnicities, residents such as Batak, Ambon, Nias, Menado, Javanese, Chinese, the church was founded by the colonial government.<sup>29</sup>

<sup>25</sup> Mestika Zed, *Kota Padang Tempo Doeloe (Zaman Kolonial), Seri Manuskrip No. 04*,

<sup>26</sup> Freek Colombijn, *Paco-Paco (Kota) Padang: Sejarah Sebuah Kota di Indonesia pada Abad ke-20 dan Penggunaan Ruang Kota*.

<sup>27</sup> Gusti Asnan, "Keberagaman di Sumatera Barat: Sebuah Perbandingan antara Daerah Pusat dan Pinggiran pada Masa Lalu dan Dewasa Ini," in *Makalah, Disajikan Pada "Seminar Hasil Penelitian para Peneliti BPNB Se-Indonesia: Multikultural, Inklusifnya Keberagaman, 22-24 April (Bukittinggi, 2014)*.

<sup>28</sup> J. S. Furnivall, *Netherlands India; A Study of Plural Economy* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010), <http://ebooks.cambridge.org/ref/id/CBO9780511707964>.

<sup>29</sup> Gusti Asnan, "Kafir, Islam dan Kristen di Negeri Kita Yang Baru: Sumatera Barat dalam Berbagai Catatan Perjalanan," *Tabuah: Ta'limat Budaya, Agama dan Humaniora*, no. 5



Together, Chinese ethnic, along with the Eastern foreign groups, as mentioned above (Arabic and Indian), occupy the second layer in the structure of colonial society in the city of Padang. Those who work as VOC intermediaries and Dutch trust agents were allowed to build their settlements, called *Kampung Cina*, also well known as Chinatown. They are free to express their own culture, such as the Lion Dance as a form of self-declaration and social acculturation media,<sup>30</sup> and have their burial ground, including the Temple as a place of worship and religious ceremonies. But their relationship with Minang residents was filled with gaps and suspicion. Apart from religious differences, it was also due to being involved in the opium trade to Minangkabau, which became a central issue in the Paderi upheaval in the 19<sup>th</sup> Century.<sup>31</sup> Even nowadays, the relationship with this pattern is still ongoing for both economic and religious relations, except for those who have embraced Islam; tolerance becomes an essential element of social integration.<sup>32</sup>

Meanwhile, the presence of Nias people in Padang City was due to the need for a large number of workers by the Chinese merchants, political authorities in Sumatra, such as Aceh and the Dutch East Indies.<sup>33</sup> The Dutch colonial government used them as laborers and designers (planners) of new settlements in Padang City.<sup>34</sup> Although they were mostly immigrated in the 19<sup>th</sup> Century, long before that, some had immigrated (around the sixteenth century) along with the emergence of migrants from China, Arabic, India, and Jawa.<sup>35</sup>

---

(1999): 1–13.

<sup>30</sup> Ediwar, Fredrik Tirtosuryo Esoputra, and Erman Har, “The Performing Art of Barongsai as the Cultural Signifier of Tionghoa Community in Padang Cit,” *The Social Sciences* 12, no. 6 (2017): 1048–1055.

<sup>31</sup> Mestika Zed, *Kota Padang Tempo Doeloe (Zaman Kolonial), Seri Manuskrip No. 04*.

<sup>32</sup> Anatona and Teuku Ibrahim Alfian, “Perdagangan Budak Di Pulau Nias 18201860,” *Sosiobumanika* 14, no. 2 (2001): 309–322.

<sup>33</sup> Anatona and Teuku Ibrahim Alfian, “Perdagangan Budak Di Pulau Nias 18201860,” *Sosiobumanika* 14, no. 2 (2001): 309–322.

<sup>34</sup> Indrayuda, *Tari Balanse Madam Suatu Aktivitas Kesenian Dan Peranannya Dalam Integrasi Sosial Antara Masyarakat Nias Dan Minangkabau Di Kota Padang* (Padang, 2004).

<sup>35</sup> Laila Kholid Alfirhaus, Eric Hiariej, and Farsijana Adeney-Risakotta, “The Position of Minang-Chinese Relationship in the History of Inter-Ethnic Groups Relations in Padang,” *AL-A'RAF*– Vol. XVII, No. 2, December 2020



Although it has become an overseas and compound area, Padang is an integral part of the Minangkabau realm. Tensions between supporters of custom and Islamic orthodoxy as a general portrait of the dynamics of Islam in Minangkabau also occur.<sup>36</sup> During the initial period, not only it occurred amongst Minang community, but the period of regional autonomy touched the non-Muslim circles. When regional autonomy rolled in, Padang City was one of the regions that echoed local identity back to *nagari* (custom) and returning to *surau* (Islam) through shari'a regulations.<sup>37</sup> Mellisa Crouch's noted that this province produces the most significant number of regulations, 40 in total on religious regulations (religious regulations), compared to other provinces in Indonesia.<sup>38</sup> Michael Buehler recorded, even more, namely 54 in the span between 1998 and 2013. However, categorizing it as the second-largest province after West Java province, 103 local regulations out of 34 provinces were traced.<sup>39</sup>

The above-mentioned local regulations regulate many things about the life of a Muslim; (1) about morality; (2) *zakat* problems; (3) about faith; (4) financial issues in Islam; (5); Islamic education; (6) Muslim fashion; (7) and others.<sup>40</sup> Regional Regulations (*Perda*) on Muslim style

---

West Sumatra," *Jurnal Humaniora* 28, no. 1 (2016): 79–96.

<sup>36</sup> Laila Kholid Alfirmada, "Disaster and Discrimination: The Ethnic Chinese Minority in Padang in the Aftermath of the September 2009 Earthquake," *Journal of Social Issues in Southeast Asia* 29, no. 1 (2014): 159, <https://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg/publication/1960>.

<sup>37</sup> Melissa Crouch, "Religious Regulations in Indonesia: Failing Vulnerable Groups," *Review of Indonesian and Malaysian Affairs* 43, no. 2 (2009): 8; Bush Robin, "Regional Syaria Regulations In Indonesia: Anomaly or Symptom?," in *Expressing Islam: Religious Live and Politics in Indonesia*, ed. Greg Fealy and Sally White (Singapore: ISEAS, 2008), 189; Michael Buehler and Dani Muhtada, "Democratization and The Diffusion of Shari'a Law," *South East Asia Research* 24, no. 2 (June 18, 2016): 261–282, <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1177/0967828X16649311>.

<sup>38</sup> Melissa Crouch, "Religious Regulations in Indonesia: Failing Vulnerable Groups."

<sup>39</sup> Michael Buehler, *The Politics of Shari'a Law Islamist Activists and the State in Democratizing Indonesia* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016).

<sup>40</sup> D Muhtada, "Perda Syariah di Indonesia: Penyebaran, Problem dan Tantangannya," in *Orasi Ilimiah Dalam Rangka Dies Natalis VII Fakultas Hukum Universitas Negeri Semarang pada 4 Desember* (Semarang: Fakultas Hukum Universitas Negeri Semarang, 2014), 1–11, [https://www.academia.edu/download/37185422/Orasi\\_Dies\\_Natalis.pdf](https://www.academia.edu/download/37185422/Orasi_Dies_Natalis.pdf).

appears at least in 9 local regulations in various districts and cities in West Sumatra, including Padang City. Three of them are directly related to school public spaces in the context of non-Muslim students. *First*, local regulation number 6 of 2003 related to “Obligations to Read Al-Qur’an for Elementary Schools and *Madrasah Ibtidaiyah* Students.” *Second*, Regional Regulation number 5 of 2011 related to the Implementation of Education to strengthen and further elaborate the content of the above regulations. They cover some number obligations; “Following the commemoration of each other’s religious holidays, followed the Ramadan boarding school, religious lectures for teenagers, wearing Muslim uniforms, good at reading and writing the Qur’an, memorizing *Juz ‘Amma* and *Asmaul Husna* for those who are Muslims.” *Third*, “Mayor’s Instruction number 451,422/ Binsos-III/2005 concerning Muslim dress obligations and several other provisions such as Youth Religious lectures, Early Morning Education and Anti-Narcotics/Narcotics/Narcotics”.<sup>41</sup>

The various Islamic policies above are aimed only at Muslim students. Many religious obligations as contained in Regional Regulations (*Perda*) number 5 of 2011, for example, are intended solely for “those who are Muslims” and non-Muslim students, “Following similar activities”.<sup>42</sup> In practice, such activities intended for Christian students are school pastoral. As for the dress regulation for Muslim women in Instruction number 451.422/Binsos-III/2005 regulated by Padang City mayor has excluded non-Muslim students. “It is advisable that non-Muslim students may wear female Muslim school uniforms and trousers for male”.<sup>43</sup>

In fact, in its practice, SMKN 2 (Public Vocational High School) and SMAN 6 (Public Senior High School) which the regulations turn out to be quite confusing. For example, in Student Regulations and Rules of SMKN 2 of 2013 Padang mentioned that “students’ uniform on Monday

<sup>41</sup> Keputusan Gubernur Sumatera Barat, “Peraturan Daerah Provinsi Sumatera Barat Nomor 3 Tahun 2007 tentang Pendidikan Al-Quran” (Padang, 2007).

<sup>42</sup> Pemerintahan Kota Padang, “Peraturan Daerah Kota Padang Nomor 5 Tahun tentang Penyelenggaraan Pendidikan” (Padang, 2011).

<sup>43</sup> See point ten of Instruksi Walikota Padang Nomor 451.422/ Binsos-III/2005.

to Wednesday and Saturday are gray trousers/gray long skirt and white long sleeve shirt (female long sleeve collar shirt in accordance to the model determined along with *mudhawarah* (the old model hijab also known as *lilike*)/in a triangle form, headgear without lace or plain ...”<sup>44</sup> Besides, it was also mentioned that” On Friday, the female student wears a Muslim school uniform with her *mudhawarah*/in a triangle form and an ankle-length black skirt, and the male student wears Muslim *koko* shirt (long sleeve shirt with short or folded collar) and is advised that they wear a national skullcap.”<sup>45</sup> Both of the regulations and rules did not mention any clauses related to non-Muslim students: “the what and the why things” about them, as a result, it was revealed that they had to “to adapt and to dress the way their Muslim schoolmates do.”<sup>46</sup> This is often analogous to the student regulations and rules implemented in Don Bosco high school to Muslim students in which they are not allowed to wear Muslim school uniforms except only on Islamic memorial days, also there is no available room allocated for prayer.<sup>47</sup> To conclude, the other analogy revealed that “in a flock of white sheep which is interrupted by a blue sheep, then the blue sheep is to adjust”.<sup>48</sup>

---

<sup>44</sup> See Peraturan dan Tata Tertib Siswa SMKN 2 Padang Tahun 2013 yang masih tetap berlaku pada tahun 2014

<sup>45</sup> Peraturan dan Tata Tertib Siswa SMKN 2 Padang Tahun 2013 yang masih tetap berlaku pada tahun 2014

<sup>46</sup> Andri Ashadi, *Multikulturalisme: Berebut Identitas di Ruang Publik* (Padang: Imam Bonjol Press, 2015).

<sup>47</sup> Andri Ashadi, Ayu Rustriana, and Muhammad Hendrik Albukhari, *Pengalaman Multikulturalisme Pelajar Islam dan Kristen SMA Don Bosco Padang* (Padang: Pusat Penelitian dan Penerbitan IAIN Imam Bonjol, 2013).

<sup>48</sup> Deny Hamdani, “The Formalisation of Islamic Attire in Padang, West Sumatra,” *Journal of Indonesia Islam* 3, no. 1 (June 1, 2009): 69–96, <http://jiis.uinsby.ac.id/index.php/JIIs/article/view/42>.

## The Minority who “Resist”



Picture (1) Author's photo collection, October 2014

At first glance, the picture (1) above looks familiar, especially for Padang City, West Sumatra with *Adat Basandi Syara 'Syara' Basandi Kitabullah* (Custom is based on Religion, and Religion is based on the Qur'an) philosophy.<sup>49</sup> It is a picture of three female students studying at one of the secondary schools in Padang City. They wear Female Muslim student uniforms, namely, hijab, long sleeve collar shirt, and ankle-length skirts. It looks neat, polite, and generally understandable that this is the typical female Muslim school uniform. However, because they are non-Muslim students (Christians), and so undeniably, it arouses a strange feeling over it. In addition to their Muslim appearance, those students also took part in *kultum* (an Islamic 7 minutes lecture) as well as attending Islamic Religion Education class at school. The reasons are the lack of school strict rules about this issue as well as this is part of the self-adaptation since they are attending Muslim majority school.<sup>50</sup>

<sup>49</sup> Both constructs are often interpreted as an inseparable relationship between Minangkabau custom and *'syara'* (Islam) for it is the social system as well as Minangkabau self-identity. In fact, for two last decades, they had transformed into a public space Islamization movement, including a school environment.

<sup>50</sup> Andri Ashadi, "Muslim Paruh Waktu di SMAN 6 dan SMKN 2 Kota Padang," **AL-A'RAF**– Vol. XVII, No. 2, December 2020

Right on the left side is LSS, an overseas school girl, originated from South Tapanuli. She completed her elementary school education in South Tapanuli and continuing her next-level education in Kalam Kudus Junior High School in Padang City. She started to get along and wear a female Muslim school uniform when entering Public Vocational High School (SMKN 2) Padang. Similar to other schools in Padang City, it has no different regulations and rules about Muslim school uniforms. She has no objection to wearing a female Muslim school uniform, which including wearing a long sleeve collar shirt and ankle-length skirt. However, she feels objected to wearing her particular school hijab called *mudhawarah* (the old model hijab also known as lilik)/in a triangle form, headgear without lace or plain...”.<sup>51</sup> She considered that wearing long sleeve collar shirt and a long ankle-length skirt along with a *hijab* is adequate without necessarily making it into *mudhawarah*. “The objection was reflected in her attitude in which the participant keeps fanning on her face to show her complaint that she felt swelter and overheated during the interview. The participant disagrees with adjusting the school uniform into a short sleeve collar and knee-length skirt since the participant wants to look similar to her majority Muslim schoolmates.<sup>52</sup>

Right to the middle position is SLB. Just like LSS, this young girl was born in Nias and was taken by her parents to try her luck in Padang City. She claimed that she has been wearing a Muslim school uniform since elementary school (2005), when the obligation to wear it had been the instructions of the Mayor of Padang. She did not mind wearing it because she was used to it. She considered it a form of participation to wear a Muslim school uniform, particularly on Friday, since she studies in a Muslim majority school. However, she always remembers her parents’ advice that a Christian should not dress the way other religions do. After all, she agrees with her parents’ speech that they live in a monotheistic

---

*Religió: Jurnal Studi Agama-agama* 7, no. 2 (2017): 205–236.

<sup>51</sup> Andri Ashadi, “Muslim Paruh Waktu di SMAN 6 dan SMKN 2 Kota Padang, 36.

<sup>52</sup> Andri Ashadi, *Multikulturalisme: Berebut Identitas di Ruang Publik*, 113.

country and so it is to follow the regulations and rules. LSS revealed that the first principle of Pancasila (national principle of Indonesia) is an affirmation of one's freedom to carry out their respective religious doctrines. Also, LSS found it delightful when her neighbor, Mother Haji, whose house is close to hers, bought a new hijab for her to replace her old shabby veil.<sup>53</sup>

Meanwhile, on the right side is ITW. Both are descendants of Nias, and it is just that ITW was born in Padang City. She was more fortunate than SLB and LSS because, in class, she was still trusted by her classmates who were predominantly Muslim to be the class leader. She was successively elected by acclamation twice. She often tidied her classmates' Muslim uniforms that are not neat. She even reminded her fellow Muslim friends to pray and even check for their attendance list. She also wearing a hijab without necessarily objected to it, and yet referring to her mother's principle that "Maria is wearing a veil as well."<sup>54</sup> Even so, it does not necessarily mean that she is happy and proud of the Muslim school uniform that binds her. After school, she never wore it. The writer also had difficulty recognizing when visiting her house for interviewing purposes. At the other time, several times ITW never answered researchers' phone calls because she "enjoys" carrying out her religious activities.<sup>55</sup>

The three students above may represent the expressions and daily experiences of dozens of non-Muslim students in both schools; SMAN 6 and SMKN 2 Padang. They need to adapt to the regulation to avoid ambivalently; on one side, they hide their protest. However, they can't get away from it. The fragments of the stories above can be reflected in James Scott's phrase, a neo-Marxist social movement theorist, which is part of a complete record in their meetings and relations with the dominant parties

---

<sup>53</sup> Andri Ashadi, *Multikulturalisme: Berebut Identitas di Ruang Publik*, 114. <sup>54</sup> Andri Ashadi, *Multikulturalisme: Berebut Identitas di Ruang Publik*, 122. <sup>55</sup> Andri Ashadi, *Multikulturalisme: Berebut Identitas di Ruang Publik*, 122.

<sup>54</sup> Andri Ashadi, *Multikulturalisme: Berebut Identitas di Ruang Publik*, 122.

<sup>55</sup> Andri Ashadi, *Multikulturalisme: Berebut Identitas di Ruang Publik*, 122.

(schools and Muslim communities in Minang) that are safe and worthy of disclosure.<sup>56</sup> In this context, they are confronted with the critical implication of hegemony, namely that class government is not caused by sanctions and coercion, but rather because of the agreement and adjustment of the ruling classes. It is just that, even though on the surface what is seen is compliance, but in truth, as James Scott called it, it is a resistance which he calls a hidden transcript (hidden resistance). It emerges in the form of sporadic resistance, not systematic, selfishness, and evolution but is inclusive of the order of domination.<sup>57</sup> This presupposes that in any domination there is always a hidden resistance that arises among them in the form of gossip and pretense.

Gossip is a narrative about an absent third person; when decomposed, it becomes blurred without genealogy, but it has many sources. Gossip becomes a kind of democratic voice, where power or possibly oppression may lead to action without honored turns into violence.<sup>58</sup> Hence, gossip is always seen as one way that is rarely used for an always loose group to close the resistant action through a safe incognito tool. However, gossip is not a narration to respect individuality but it is to respect the communal bigger norm in which the gossip took place. Possibly, there is no one pays attention to regulations and rules of school uniform until someone finally broke it and therefore triggered a statement about appropriateness.<sup>59</sup> As a Christian, LSS considered that wearing a long sleeve shirt and ankle-length skirt as normality. However, when it comes to mudhawarah, she felt that as “an objection” and violating the dignity as a Christian. Meanwhile, SLB connects the appropriateness with Pancasila as the basis of one’s freedom to express themselves by their respective religions and beliefs.

The gossip is increasingly apparent when articulated by their parents.

---

<sup>56</sup> James C. Scott, *Senjatanya Orang-Orang yang Kalah*, 378.

<sup>57</sup> James C. Scott, *Senjatanya Orang-Orang yang Kalah*, 385-386.

<sup>58</sup> James C. Scott, *Senjatanya Orang-Orang yang Kalah*, 373.

<sup>59</sup> James C. Scott, *Senjatanya Orang-Orang yang Kalah*, 372.



TB, SLB parents can not understand why their children and friends do not get appreciation from their teachers; instead, it seems that they tend to be cornered and mentioned. The students are obeying the regulations and rules about Muslim school uniforms, particularly in Islamic activities, but still, they are corner. The teacher should embrace and unite all children.<sup>60</sup> Even though he showed dislike, he did not blame FB, the mayor of Padang City at that time, who was the source of various policies on the Islamic program of the school including on Muslim school uniform. According to him, the mayor is already good at carrying out his policies. When Muslim students conduct Ramadan boarding schools in mosques, Christian students get pastoral schooling in the church. Also, the Major himself who providing budget funds for these activities are frequently present at the opening and closing of the event. However, he regretted that the field implementation is causing discrimination. He never openly expresses this protest for the sake of his children's education continuation and comfort.<sup>61</sup>

Different from TB, parents of ITW, A is not too concerned about the religious policies above, as long as they are limited to the environment and school hours. When it comes to wearing Muslim school uniform regulation, she instead offers a photo of her wedding wearing Muslim clothes. On one side, this is a form of acculturation between the Minang culture and her culture (Nias) which has been going on for a long time.<sup>62</sup> On the other hand, it is also a form of pride that she can adapt to Minang culture as the majority culture. Her church, BNKP (*Banua Niba Keriso Protestant*) always reminds the congregation to dress neatly and politely even though she thinks that the congregation does not necessarily be heedful. Her inclusive outlook and accommodative attitude did not emerge suddenly but were rooted in the intensity of her interaction

---

<sup>60</sup> Ashadi, Rustriana, and Albukhari, *Pengalaman Multikulturalisme Pelajar Islam dan Kristen SMA Don Bosco Padang*, 70.

<sup>61</sup> Ashadi, Rustriana, and Albukhari, *Pengalaman Multikulturalisme Pelajar Islam dan Kristen SMA Don Bosco Padang*, 76.

<sup>62</sup> Although it is hard to track, Nias people have been settled in this city along with the other ethnicities such as Chinese and VOC in 17<sup>th</sup> century. Even, some mentioned that it had happened since the 16<sup>th</sup> century. Hence, the acculturation between Nias culture

experience with the Muslim environment. In addition to having brothers and uncles who had embraced Islam, she had been educated at *Madrasah Ibtidaiyah Negeri* (MIN), it is a Public Islamic Elementary School. “I can speak Arabic (Malay Arabic) and write names in Arabic. I know a lot about Islamic teachings; Al-Qur’an, Hadis, *Tarikh* of Islam, moral creed, I know everything,” she revealed.<sup>63</sup>

On the other hand, Scott continued, people’s attitudes in stressful situations are almost always not authentic. Hence, pretending is considered as a unique and essential expression for the marginalized classes; the purpose is to be able to draw certain benefits from the dominant community, it also to express the resistance against those who dominate. As a result, the occurrence of up and down movement amongst respect, demeaning without asking and outbursts of disappointment or anger is a certainty.<sup>64</sup> Even though they have articulated protests against the rules of Muslim dress in their schools, SLB is still happy if a new hijab is bought for her by their Muslim neighbors. This daughter of a motorcycle repair shop technician feels it helps if anyone is willing to buy school clothes for her. Moreover, she also has many brothers who are still in school. But unlike most of her Christian friends who dress in Muslim school uniform only in the school environment, she has worn it from home. Even back home after school hours.<sup>65</sup>

Different from SLB, the same as her mother’s accommodative attitude, in several interviews not once did ITW show a protest attitude towards the Islamic policies of her school. She looks relaxed and mediocre. Among her Christian friends, she always appeared more presentable, looking elegant like the figures of Muslim students who wore Muslim school uniforms. Hence, her Muslim friends like to hang out with her and even choose her as class chairman. ITW even tried to find a justification

---

<sup>63</sup> Ashadi, Rustriana, and Albukhari, *Pengalaman Multikulturalisme Pelajar Islam dan Kristen SMA Don Bosco Padang*, 75.

<sup>64</sup> James C. Scott, *Senjatanya Orang-Orang yang Kalah*, 376–377.

<sup>65</sup> Andri Ashadi, *Multikulturalisme: Berebut Identitas di Ruang Publik*, 106.

for wearing the hijab in Christianity even though she was never worn it after school hours. The impressive pretense was also exhibited by SM, who was almost involved in all Islamic activities at her school. She did not feel hesitant to say “astaghfirullah” when surprised by her friends. The speech of “Assalamu’alaikum sir,” just flowed from her mouth when she met her school’s Islamic Education teacher. “Ah you,” replied the teacher who always reminds her about the social and religious boundaries including greetings from and to non-Muslims.<sup>66</sup> Even so, she still protested when the celebration of her religious holidays could not be celebrated at school because it coincided with national holidays.<sup>67</sup>

### **The Majority who are Fascinated**

The pretense and imitation have succeeded in deceiving, changing the actual reality to be vague, not to mention false. Using the perspective of Jean Baudrillard (1929-2007), their phenomenon on the stage of Islamic identity can be referred to as simulacra. It is an action to imitate certain actions with the tricking intention, fake appearance, resemblance, surface, imitation of something. Like a prototype of an airplane when a prospective pilot learns to fly an airplane by imitating. Moreover, Simulation itself is “to distinguish the boundary between the real and the imaginary, the real with the fake.”<sup>68</sup>

Despite showing protest, but SLB’s loyalty to continue wearing Muslim clothing from home to school, has amazed her Muslim neighbor, Mother Haji. She bought SLB hijab no matter that she is not a Muslim. SLB succeeded in dispelling the suspicion of Mother Haji, that she is a Christian who pretends to be Muslim. However, still, SLB is a devout person in which she strongly remembers her parents’ advice to keep working on her principle when associating with followers of other religions. Also, YS (parent of Muslim students) mentioned that the

<sup>66</sup> Andri Ashadi, *Multikulturalisme: Berebut Identitas di Ruang Publik*, 106.

<sup>67</sup> Andri Ashadi, *Multikulturalisme: Berebut Identitas di Ruang Publik*, 117.

<sup>68</sup> Akhyar Lubis, *Postmodernisme: Teori dan Praktek*, 174.

message of Islamic da'wah has reached those who are obliged to cover their body by wearing Muslim clothes. Besides, she also added that schools couldn't make their own rules for Christian students.<sup>69</sup>

The pretense of ITW by wearing a Muslim school uniform has succeeded in presenting an almost perfect imitation of reality. She was not only loved by her classmates, but she also elected twice to the role of the class, as well they like her since she often tidied their hijab. This reality has closed another space that they (Muslim students) have chosen for two consecutive terms as class leaders and who have tidied up their hijab are not Muslim. Even the teachers were fascinated by making themselves as models for the neatness of wearing Muslim school uniform, without realizing that the model should be and is real from Muslim students themselves. And that is the actual reality in the field.

The narration of Christian student resistance in submission and admiration “wrong address” against it, on the one hand, leads to the discourse and movement of Islamism in Indonesia, especially West Sumatra. On the other hand, it is a strong connection to the ambiguous and collective culture of the Minangkabau. Islamism is a new perspective that is often used in analyzing Islamic practices in many Muslim-majority countries such as Iran, including Indonesia.<sup>70</sup> Islamism is an idea of the trustworthiness of the relationship between Islamic doctrine and various aspects of Muslim life.<sup>71</sup> Both as a social and political phenomenon, Islamism involves the contestation of values, interpretations, and religious symbols, as well as governmental institutions and powers.<sup>72</sup> Even though the orientation is not always aimed towards the realization of an Islamic state, it is essential to note that Islamism always strives for Islam to play a

---

<sup>69</sup> Andri Ashadi, *Multikulturalisme: Berebut Identitas di Ruang Publik*, 67.

<sup>70</sup> Asef Bayat, *Post-Islamism at Large*, in *Post-Islamism: The Changing Faces of Political Islam*, ed. Asef Bayat (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013), 8.

<sup>71</sup> Saiful Mujani et al., *Benturan Peradaban: Sikap dan Perilaku Islamis Indonesia terhadap Amerika Serikat* (Jakarta: Nalar, 2005), 28–29.

<sup>72</sup> Trevor W Preston, *Pancasila/Syari'a: Contemporary Islamism and the Politics of Post Soeharto Indonesia* (Columbia: University of British Columbia, 2002), 1.

more significant role in social, political, and government life.<sup>73</sup> This is in line with the assumption that Islam is a total civilization that guides every individual or collective action.<sup>74</sup>

However, excessive enthusiasm for Islam to play a greater role in a Muslim-majority country often discriminates against vulnerable groups such as women and religious minorities.<sup>75</sup> Therefore, no wonder that Olivier Roy stated that Islamism a modern brand of the fundamentalist Islamic movement which claims to re-create a truly Islamic society. These efforts are not enough to present an Islamist atmosphere, but for the first time by establishing an Islamic state through political action. In its implementation, these political actions often clash with the established order, including social and religious diversity.<sup>76</sup>

Even though in the three regional regulations above, there was an effort to combine religiousness and rights, beliefs and freedom, Islam and liberation as a sign of the post-Islamism movement,<sup>77</sup> but the content of Islamism remained dominant. This matter can be seen in at least 10 of the 12 points of the Padang Mayor's Instruction Number 451,422/ Binsos-III/2005 related to the program and technical implementation of Islamic programs, including in public schools. Likewise, on the religious nuances in Padang City Regulation number 5 of 2011 concerning the Implementation of Education.<sup>78</sup> Then what about the religiosity, rights, beliefs, and freedom of non-Muslim students as it is called Bayat? Both local regulations do not accommodate this, even though it states that

---

<sup>73</sup> Muhammad Anzor, "Post-Islamism and the Remaking of Islamic Public Sphere in Post-Reform Indonesia," *Studia Islamika* 23, no. 3 (December 30, 2016): 471– 515, <http://journal.uinjkt.ac.id/index.php/studia-islamika/article/view/2412>.

<sup>74</sup> Tholkhatul Khoir, "Tujuh Karakter Fundamentalisme Islam," *Al-Tabrir: Jurnal Pemikiran Islam* 14, no. 1 (January 9, 2014): 47–71.

<sup>75</sup> Melissa Crouch, *Religious Regulations in Indonesia: Failing Vulnerable Groups*, 8 <sup>76</sup> Olivier Roy, "Globalized Islam: The Search for A New Ummah," *Islamology* 7, no. 1 (June 30, 2017): 11–40, <http://islamology.in/journal/article/view/145>.

<sup>76</sup> Olivier Roy, "Globalized Islam: The Search for A New Ummah," *Islamology* 7, no. 1 (June 30, 2017): 11–40, <http://islamology.in/journal/article/view/145>.

<sup>77</sup> Asef Bayat, *Post-Islamism at Large*, in *Post-Islamism: The Changing Faces of Political Islam*.

<sup>78</sup> Pemerintah Kota Padang, *Perda Kota Padang Nomor 5 Tahun 2011 tentang Penyelenggaraan Pendidikan*, 2011.

“Every student is obliged to carry out the religious obligations or orders he adheres to and to hold a commemoration of their religious holidays. It is also emphasized that “Every student has the right to access religious and religiosity education services following the religion and beliefs of each student, both in public schools and outside school.”<sup>79</sup> In reality, they get all these religious rights and obligations outside of school through Sunday school. Uniquely, in the schoolroom, they accept the implications of the school Islamism program to adjust even though not fully like Muslim students, “It is recommended to wear long-sleeve collar skirt and ankle-length skirt along with *mudhawarah* for women and trousers for men.”<sup>80</sup>

Islamism itself is deeply rooted in the dynamics of the Minang community, going on beyond Islamism that occurred after independence and reform. This can at least be referred to as the Paderi’s movement lasted around 1803-1819. Mestika Zed revealed that even called it the first and largest radical movement in Southeast Asia because it wiped out its opponents, especially from the indigenous groups who remained loyal to the old customs.<sup>81</sup> In the name of Islamism, they did not hesitate to burn traditional houses, and Tuanku Nan Renceh himself demonstrated the murder of his aunt for using tobacco. They required every Minang male to dress in white as a symbol of purity, lengthen his beard, and forbid the use of gold and silk, and ruled the woman to use the *hijab*. And five-time prayer is a necessity and is fined for violating it.<sup>82</sup>

The next question is why in the strengthening currents of Islamism in Padang city, as shown in sub-c; then, it raises the phenomenon of admiration for the hybrid identity of Christian students? Identity more widely understood during the past two decades as a political tool to

---

<sup>79</sup> Pemerintah Kota Padang, *Perda Kota Padang Nomor 5 Tahun 2011 tentang Penyelenggaraan Pendidikan*, 2011.

<sup>80</sup> Andri Ashadi, “Muslim Paruh Waktu di SMAN 6 dan SMKN 2 Kota Padang.”

<sup>81</sup> Mestika Zed, “Islam dan Budaya Lokal Minangkabau Modren,” in *Makar Sejarah dan Perkembangan Fundamentalisme Islam di Nusantara* (Bukittinggi: STAIN Djamil Djambek, 2010), 4–5.

<sup>82</sup> Christine Dobbin, *Gejolak Ekonomi, Kebangkitan Islam, dan Gerakan Padri: Minangkabau 1784-1847*, Terjemahan. (Depok: Komunitas Bambu, 2008), 209–210.

distinguish themselves from other groups, is it not? Together with the strengthening of Islamic identity through shari'a regulations, the Minang community is also compassionate toward issues surrounding non-Muslims and their existence, especially to the problem of Christianization. The case of the kidnapping and rape of a Minang girl in 1999 by a Christian, Salmon Melianus Ongirwalu, was one of the cases that horrified the Minang realm. Even though the person concerned has been convicted and sentenced, it still does not satisfy the Minang community, and through this case, Christianization is considered a real threat.<sup>83</sup> In another case, the Minang community's anger towards a Muslim Minang, Yarwardi Koto was not only because he had converted to Christianity, but also because he had used traditional custom symbols (which are identical to Islam) in religious activities in his new religion. He founded the Nazarene Rantau Christian Church (in Jakarta) with Minang special carvings and traditional clothing aimed specifically at Minang nomads who had converted to Christianity.<sup>84</sup>

It seems that the paradoxical phenomenon above found its roots in Minangkabau culture as one of the primary identities of the Minang people.<sup>85</sup> There are at least two Minang cultural characters in this context. First, through the examples above it can be seen that the Minang culture is ambiguous, changing, and moving in two opposite directions, so it is difficult to understand.<sup>86</sup> On the one hand, it shows the strengthening of identity, but on the other hand, it even tolerates the crossing of identity, so that makes something that was initially different, clear, and

---

<sup>83</sup> Mina Elfira, "Not Muslim, Not Minangkabau: Interreligious Marriage and Its Cultural Impact in Minangkabau Society," in *Muslim-Non-Muslim Marriage: Political and Cultural Contestations in Southeast Asia*, ed. and Maznah Mohamad Gavin W. Jones, Chee Heng Leng (Singapore: ISEAS–Yusof Ishak Institute, 2009), 168–170.

<sup>84</sup> Kurnial Ilahi, Jamaluddin Rabain, and Suja'i Sarifandi, "Dari Islam ke Kristen: Konversi Agama pada Masyarakat Suku Minangkabau," *Madania: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Keislaman* 8, no. 2 (February 21, 2019): 201–227, <http://ejournal.uin-suska.ac.id/index.php/madania/article/view/5728>.

<sup>85</sup> Stella Ting-Toomey, "Communication Across Cultures," *International Journal of Intercultural Relations* 25 (2001): 30–31.

<sup>86</sup> Zainal Arifin, "Dualitas Praktik Perkawinan Minangkabau," *Humaniora* 21, no. 2 (2012): 150–161.



straightforward become vague and ambiguous. Strangely, this ambiguous thing (Christian students dressed in Muslim school uniform) became a role model and source of admiration.

This phenomenon does not arise suddenly, and it is rooted in customary nature which is also ambiguous. On the one hand, adat is considered a rule that must be implemented, but at the same time, it opens itself to be redefined and reconstructed which makes the attitude of adherents to change.<sup>87</sup> This is seen, for example, in two traditional customs categories; *nan babubua mati* dan *nan babubua sentak* (customs that should not be altered and customs that can vary according to the context of space and time). *Adaik nan sabana* is the norms, values, and rules that are intrinsically considered inherent in humans, and *adaik nan diadaikan* is the norms, values, and regulations established by Datuak Katamenggungan and Datuak Prapatiah nan Sabatang as formulators included in the first type of custom category. While for the second type of custom category is *adaik nan teradaikan* is rules that are formulated and generally accepted in a nagari (*adaik salingka nagari*) and *adaik istidaik*; habits, regulations and creations that applied by a particular nagari context.<sup>88</sup>

The shari'a regional regulation policy, which gave birth to the ambiguous attitude of the Minang people above, is included in the second category of custom, which in practice varies from one region to another. Of the total 19 regencies and cities, local regulations and instructions for Muslim women's clothing, for example, only appeared in 9 cities and districts.<sup>89</sup> The application of one school to another for non-Muslim students also varies in Padang City. Some are like Muslim students like in this research location, but there are also those following the intended instructions of Padang mayor; only a long sleeve collar shirt without a hijab or veil. In this context, the custom proverb *Sakali ayia gadang sakali tapian*

<sup>87</sup> Zainal Arifin, "Dualitas Praktik Perkawinan Minangkabau, 154.

<sup>88</sup> Zainal Arifin, "Dualitas Praktik Perkawinan Minangkabau, 154.

<sup>89</sup> Deny Hamdani, "The Formalisation of Islamic Attire in Padang, West Sumatra," 69–69.

*barubab* applies (once a river is an overflow, then the river bank will change as well), which indicates that the change, including a shift in attitude, is considered as normal and natural.

Secondly, the values and self-concepts that live in Minangkabau custom/culture are more collective. According to Stella Ting Toomey, citizens of Guatemala, Ecuador, Panama, Venezuela, Colombia, Pakistan, Costa Rica, Peru, and Indonesia, have a very collective self-concept.

Collectivism, according to him, stressed the importance of “we” (our) identity above “I” (me) status, group rights over individual rights, and group interest-oriented over personal interests. Otherwise, individualism emphasizes the importance of private identity rights and interests over group identity, rights, and interests. In conclusion, collectivism promotes relational dependence, in-group harmony, and the spirit of in-

group cooperation, but individualism emphasizes individual efficiency, responsibility, and personal autonomy. These two incidents are manifested in the daily interactions of families, schools, and workplaces.<sup>90</sup>

Encountering Minang (custom) culture, at the micro-scale prevailing in the *nagari*, it is more likely to prioritize an individual self-image in the presence of the adat *salingka* (whole) *nagari*. But on a Minangkabau macro-scale both in Darek (interior highlands of Minang region) and overseas, they tend to be collective. In group culture, what is dominant is the assimilationist culture that demands migrants or minority groups to adapt to the situation of the indigenous population. In this culture, the formation of ethnic identity is determined by influential group norms.<sup>91</sup> In such a culture, according to David Matsumoto (1994), “A nail that is not deeply embedded will be beaten to the ground”.<sup>92</sup> This means that a developing

<sup>90</sup> Ting-Toomey, “Communication Across Cultures,” 66–68.

<sup>91</sup> Wei Xing, “Marital Assimilation between the Muslim Hui and the Han Majority in Contemporary Chinese Cities in the People’s Republic of China,” *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs* 34, no. 3 (July 3, 2014): 303–314, <http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13602004.2014.939558>.

<sup>92</sup> David Matsumoto, *Pengantar Psikologi Lintas Budaya*, Terjemahan. (Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2008), 31–35.

self-concept is a collective self-concept that does not give more freedom to the voices of individuals, others, and minorities. In West Sumatra in general, their voices are beaten to the ground by the proverb, *di ma bumi dipijak di situ langik dijujung* (wherever the earth is stepped on, there where the sky is upheld), *tibo di kandang kabau mangoek, tibo di kandang kambing mambebek* (In the cage the buffalo is to groan, in the cage the goat is to pound) and *balain ciok dicotok induak ayam* (the chicken will peck the chicks with different sound).<sup>93</sup> The proverbs are explicitly loading with self-adjusting content.

The culmination of this assimilative culture happens when *adat basandi syarak, syarak basandi kitabullah* turns into ethnic identity for Minang people and their territory (Minangkabau territorial). As an ethnic identity, it becomes the primary identity of the Minang people because it is considered as the prime condition for someone to be called Minang. As a territorial identity, it merges with the Islamism movement, which demands compliance and uniformity because it manifests in the form of regulations or instructions such as the Islamic school program discussed above. In this context, the concept of identity provides evidence not only to emphasize differences but also means identification or self-adjustment with others. The word identity originates from *idem*, a compound from *idem et idem*, which means the same and similar, repeatedly. From this root, the word is forged into the Latin term “*identitat*” which means identification or adjustment with others.<sup>94</sup>

## Conclusion

This article argues that Islamism at the local level, Padang City, which is embodied in various shari’a regulations, potentially leads to discrimination and ambivalence. For example, two regional regulations or

---

<sup>93</sup> The custom proverbs have embodied Minangkabau people’s daily life particularly in the context of the relation between local people/indigenous and immigrant, nomads.

<sup>94</sup> Martin Sökefeld, “Debating Self, Identity, and Culture in Anthropology,” *Current Anthropology* 40, no. 4 (August 1999): 417–448, <https://www.journals.uchicago.edu/doi/10.1086/200042>.

Perda (Perda number 6 of 2003 and Perda number 5 of 2011) and one instruction or guidelines (Padang Mayor Instruction number 451,422/Binsos-III/2005) in Padang City contain various Islamic school programs that only aim at Muslim students, but they also affect to Christian students. They are forced to adjust to dress the way their Muslim schoolmates do because they do not want to be different from Muslim students. However, Islamism and the collective culture of school residents and Minang people appear to demand that Christian students need to adjust more.

Their ability to compromise with the Islamic environment and identity has quietly created a unique attraction for Muslim students and teachers. Some Christian students were elected twice consecutively to become class leaders, although most of their classmates are Muslim. They also manage to lure their teacher fascinated and make them the role model for their fellow Muslim students on how to wear appropriate Muslim school uniforms. These, however, do not deter Christian students from consistently showing that they are real Christians. They also still actively engage in their churches and often become the event organizer in the services.

## References

- Alfirdaus, Laila Kholid, Eric Hiariej, and Farsijana Adeney-Risakotta. "The Position of Minang-Chinese Relationship in the History of Inter-Ethnic Groups Relations in Padang, West Sumatra." *Jurnal Humaniora* 28, no. 1 (2016): 79–96.
- Amran, Rusli. *Sumatra Barat Hingga Plakat Panjang*. Jakarta: Penerbit Sinar Harapan, 1981.
- Anatona, and Teuku Ibrahim Alfian. "Perdagangan Budak di Pulau Nias 1820-1860." *Sosiobumanika* 14, no. 2 (2001): 309–322.
- Ansor, Muhammad. "Post-Islamism and the Remaking of Islamic Public Sphere in Post-Reform Indonesia." *Studia Islamika* 23, no. 3 (December 30, 2016): 471–515. <http://journal.uinjkt.ac.id/index.php/studia-islamika/article/view/2412>.
- Arifianto, Alexander R. "Explaining the Cause of Muslim-Christian Conflicts in Indonesia: Tracing the Origins of Kristenisasi and Islamisasi." *Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations* 20, no. 1 (January 21, 2009): 73–89. <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/>

- full/10.1080/09596410802542144.
- Arifin, Zainal. "Dualitas Praktik Perkawinan Minangkabau." *Humaniora* 21, no. 2 (2012): 150–161.
- Aritonang, Jan S. *Sejarah Perjumpaan Kristen dan Islam di Indonesia*. Jakarta: Gunung Mulia, 2006.
- Asef Bayat. "Post-Islamism at Large", in *Post-Islamism: The Changing Faces of Political Islam*. Edited by Asef Bayat. New York: Oxford University Press, 2013.
- Ashadi, Andri. *Multikulturalisme: Berebut Identitas di Ruang Publik*. Padang: Imam Bonjol Press, 2015.
- . "Muslim Paruh Waktu di SMAN 6 dan SMKN 2 Kota Padang." *Religió: Jurnal Studi Agama-agama* 7, no. 2 (2017): 205–236.
- Ashadi, Andri, Ayu Rustriana, and Muhammad Hendrik Albukhari. *Pengalaman Multikulturalisme Pelajar Islam dan Kristen SMA Don Bosco Padang*. Padang: Pusat Penelitian dan Penerbitan IAIN Imam Bonjol, 2013.
- Ashar, Faisal, Dilanthi Amaratunga, and Richard Haigh. "The Analysis of Tsunami Vertical Shelter in Padang City." In *4th International Conference on Building Resilience*, 18:916–923. United Kingdom, 2014. <https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S2212567114010181>.
- Asnan, Gusti. "Kafir, Islam dan Kristen di Negeri Kita yang Baru: Sumatera Barat dalam Berbagai Catatan Perjalanan." *Tabuah: Ta'limat Budaya, Agama dan Humaniora*, no. 5 (1999): 1–13.
- . "Keberagaman di Sumatera Barat: Sebuah Perbandingan antara Daerah Pusat dan Pinggiran pada Masa Lalu dan Dewasa Ini." In *Makalah, Disajikan Pada "Seminar Hasil Penelitian para Peneliti BPNB Se-Indonesia: Multikultural, Indahnya Keberagaman, 22-24 April*. Bukittinggi, 2014.
- Bagir, Zainal Abidin, Samsul Maarif, Achmad Munjid, Gregory Vanderbilt, Mohammad Iqbal Ahnaf, and A Bagus Laksana. *Studi Agama di Indonesia: Refleksi Pengalaman*. Yogyakarta: CRCS (Center for Religious and Cross-cultural Studies), 2015.
- Buehler, Michael. *The Politics of Shari'a Law Islamist Activists and the State in Democratizing Indonesia*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016.
- Buehler, Michael, and Dani Muhtada. "Democratization and The Diffusion of Shari'a Law." *South East Asia Research* 24, no. 2 (June 18, 2016): 261–282. <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1177/0967828X16649311>.
- Colombijn, Freek. *Paco-Paco (Kota) Padang: Sejarah Sebuah Kota di Indonesia pada Abad ke-20 dan Penggunaan Ruang Kota*. Yogyakarta: Ombak, 2006.
- Crouch, Melissa. "Religious Regulations in Indonesia: Failing Vulnerable Groups." *Review of Indonesian and Malaysian Affairs* 43, no. 2 (2009): 53–103.

- Damayanti, Angel. "Muslim-Christian Relationships in Indonesian Reform Era Within The Framework of Democracy: Case Study of Bandung, Bekasi and Bogor (1998-2015)." In *Proceedings of the Third International Conference on Social and Political Sciences (ICSPS 2017)*, 9–18. Paris, France: Atlantis Press, 2018. <http://www.atlantispress.com/php/paper-details.php?id=25891323>.
- Diskominfo. "Gambaran Umum Kota Padang." *padang.go.id*. Last modified 2016. <https://www.padang.go.id/gambaran-umum-kota-padang>.
- Dobbin, Christine. *Gejolak Ekonomi, Kebangkitan Islam, dan Gerakan Padri: Minangkabau 1784-1847*. Terjemahan. Depok: Komunitas Bambu, 2008.
- Ediwar, Fredrik Tirtosuryo Esoputra, and Erman Har. "The Performing Art of Barongsai as the Cultural Signifier of Tionghoa Community in Padang Cit." *The Social Sciences* 12, no. 6 (2017): 1048–1055.
- Elfira, Mina. "Inter-Ethnic Relations in Padang of West Sumatra Navigating Between Assimilation and Exclusivity." *Wacana: Journal of the Humanities of Indonesia* 13, no. 2 (October 1, 2011): 293–304. <http://wacana.ui.ac.id/index.php/wjhi/article/view/25>.
- . "Not Muslim, Not Minangkabau': Interreligious Marriage and Its Cultural Impact in Minangkabau Society." In *Muslim-Non-Muslim Marriage: Political and Cultural Contestations in Southeast Asia*, edited by and Maznah Mohamad Gavin W. Jones, Chee Heng Leng, 161–189. Singapura: ISEAS–Yusof Ishak Institute, 2009.
- Feener, R. Michael. "Religious Competition and Conflict Over The Longue Durée: Christianity and Islam in The Indonesian Archipelago." *Asian Journal of Religion and Society* 5, no. 1 (2017): 1–22.
- Furnivall, J. S. *Netherlands India A Study of Plural Economy*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010. <http://ebooks.cambridge.org/ref/id/CBO9780511707964>.
- Hadler, Jeffrey. *Sengketa Tiada Putus: Matriarkat, Reformisme Islam, dan Kolonoalisme di Minangkabau*. Edited by Samsudin Berlian. Terjemahan. Menteng: Freedom Institute, 2010.
- Hamdani, Deny. "The Formalisation of Islamic Attire in Padang, West Sumatra." *Journal of Indonesia Islam* 3, no. 1 (June 1, 2009): 69–96. <http://jiis.uinsby.ac.id/index.php/JIIs/article/view/42>.
- Ilahi, Kurnial, Jamaluddin Rabain, and Suja'i Sarifandi. "Dari Islam ke Kristen: Konversi Agama pada Masyarakat Suku Minangkabau." *Madania: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Keislaman* 8, no. 2 (February 21, 2019): 201–227. <http://ejournal.uin-suska.ac.id/index.php/madania/article/view/5728>.

- Indrayuda. *Tari Balanse Madam Suatu Aktivitas Kesenian dan Peranannya dalam Integrasi Sosial antara Masyarakat Nias dan Minangkabau di Kota Padang*. Padang, 2004.
- Keputusan Gubernur Sumatera Barat. “Peraturan Daerah Provinsi Sumatera Barat Nomor 3 Tahun 2007 tentang Pendidikan Al-Quran.” Padang, 2007.
- Khoir, Tholkhatul. “Tujuh Karakter Fundamentalisme Islam.” *Al-Tabrir: Jurnal Pemikiran Islam* 14, no. 1 (January 9, 2014): 47–71.
- Kholid Alfirdaus, Laila. “Disaster and Discrimination: The Ethnic Chinese Minority in Padang in the Aftermath of the September 2009 Earthquake.” *Journal of Social Issues in Southeast Asia* 29, no. 1 (2014): 159. <https://bookshop.iseas.edu.sg/publication/1960>.
- King, Roberta R. “Music, Peacebuilding, and Interfaith Dialogue: Transformative Bridges in Muslim–Christian Relations.” *International Bulletin of Mission Research* 40, no. 3 (July 18, 2016): 202–217. <http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1177/23969393166636884>.
- Loeb, Edwin M. *Sumatra: Its History and People*. England: Oxford University Press, 1972.
- Lubis, Akhyar. *Postmodernisme: Teori dan Praktek*. Jakarta: PT Grafindo Persada, 2014.
- Matsumoto, David. *Pengantar Psikologi Lintas Budaya*. Terjemahan. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar, 2008.
- Muhtada, D. “Perda Syariah di Indonesia: Penyebaran, Problem dan Tantangannya.” In *Orasi Ilmiah Dalam Rangka Dies Natalis VII Fakultas Hukum Universitas Negeri Semarang pada 4 Desember*, 1–11. Semarang: Fakultas Hukum Universitas Negeri Semarang, 2014. [https://www.academia.edu/download/37185422/Orasi\\_Dies\\_Natalis.pdf](https://www.academia.edu/download/37185422/Orasi_Dies_Natalis.pdf).
- Mujani, Saiful, Jalal Burhanuddin, Ismatu Ropi, Fuad Jabati, Oman Fathurahman, Jajang Johroni, Din Wahid, Dina Afrianti, and Tasman. *Benturan Peradaban: Sikap dan Perilaku Islamis Indonesia terhadap Amerika Serikat*. Jakarta: Nalar, 2005.
- Pemerintah Kota Padang. *Perda Kota Padang Nomor 5 Tahun 2011 tentang Penyelenggaraan Pendidikan*, 2011.
- Pemerintahan Kota Padang. “Peraturan Daerah Kota Padang Nomor 5 Tahun 2011 tentang Penyelenggaraan Pendidikan.” Padang, 2011.
- Preston, Trevor W. *Pancasila/Syari’a: Contemporary Islamism and the Politics of Post Soeharto Indonesia*. Columbia: University of British Columbia, 2002.
- Al Qurtuby, Sumanto. “Ambonese Muslim Jihadsts, Islamic Identity, and The History of Christian–Muslim Rivalry in The Moluccas, Eastern Indonesia.” *International Journal of Asian Studies* 12, no. 1 (January 28,



- 2015): 1–29.
- Robin, Bush. “Regional Syaria Regulations In Indonesia: Anomaly or Symptom?” In *Expressing Islam: Religious Live and Politics in Indonesia*, edited by Greg Fealy and Sally White. Singapore: ISEAS, 2008.
- Roy, Olivier. “Globalized Islam: The Search for a New Ummah.” *Islamology* 7, no. 1 (June 30, 2017): 11–40. <http://islamology.in/journal/article/view/145>.
- Scott, James. *Senjatanya Orang-Orang yang Kalah*. Terjemahan. Jakarta: Yayasan Obor Indonesia, 2000.
- Seo, Myengkkyo. “Missions Without Missionaries: The Social Dimension of Church Growth in Muslim Java, Indonesia.” *Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations* 24, no. 1 (January 2013): 71–89. <http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/09596410.2013.745300>.
- Sökefeld, Martin. “Debating Self, Identity, and Culture in Anthropology.” *Current Anthropology* 40, no. 4 (August 1999): 417–448. <https://www.journals.uchicago.edu/doi/10.1086/200042>.
- Sumbullah, Umi. “Muslim-Christian Relation on the Basis of Christian Village in Malang , East Java , Indonesia : Socio-Theological Reconstruction for Building Religious Harmony.” *Research on Humanities and Social Sciences* 6, no. 12 (2016): 1–7.
- Tiara, Monica, Maria Montessori, Fatmariza, and Junaidi Indrawadi. “Cross-Ethnic Society and Social Integration.” *IOSR Journal Of Humanities And Social Science* 23, no. 6 (2019): 58–60.
- Ting-Toomey, Stella. “Communication Across Cultures.” *International Journal of Intercultural Relations* 25 (2001): 459–466.
- Xing, Wei. “Marital Assimilation between the Muslim Hui and the Han Majority in Contemporary Chinese Cities in the People’s Republic of China.” *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs* 34, no. 3 (July 3, 2014): 303–314. <http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13602004.2014.939558>.
- Zed, Mestika. “Islam dan Budaya Lokal Minangkabau Modren.” In *Makar Sejarah dan Perkembangan Fundamentalisme Islam di Nusantara*. Bukittinggi: STAIN Djamil Djambek, 2010.
- . *Kota Padang Tempo Doeloe (Zaman Kolonial), Seri Manuskrip No. 04*. Padang: Pusat Kajian Sosial Budaya dan Ekonomi Fakultas Ilmu Ilmu Sosial UNP, 2009.
- Zulkarnain, Zulkarnain, and Samsuri Samsuri. “Religious Leaders and Indonesian Religious Harmony.” In *Proceedings of the Annual Civic Education Conference (ACEC 2018) Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research, Vol. 251*. Paris, France: Atlantis Press, 2018. <https://www.atlantis-press.com/article/25905915>.