

## ANHA DOTHRAK CHEK ASSHEKH: THE RENDERING OPERATION OF THE INVENTED LANGUAGE DOTHRAKI INTO BAHASA INDONESIA IN *GAME OF THRONES* SEASON 6

Anisa Wahyu Isnaini

[Anisawahyu41@gmail.com](mailto:Anisawahyu41@gmail.com)

PT Imtera Publisher and Developer

**Keywords:** Rendering, L3 translation, invented language, Dotharki, *Game of Throne*.

### Article History

Received: March 22, 2024

Published: June 30, 2024

### How To Cite (APA 7<sup>th</sup> Ed)

Isnaini, A.W. (2024). Anha Dothrak Chek Asshekh: the Rendering Operation of the Invented Language Dothraki into Bahasa Indonesia in *Game of Thrones* Season 6. *CrossOver Journal of Adaptation Studies*, 4 (1).

<https://doi.org/10.22515/crossover.v4i1.8836>

### Abstract

This research is conducted to observe the rendering operation of L3 translation applied of *Game of Thrones* series Season 6, specifically focusing on two objectives: identifying the types of rendering operations used and explaining why these operations are chosen. The research adopts a descriptive qualitative approach. Corrius and Zabalbeascoa's theory on L3 translation rendering operations serves as the framework for addressing the research questions. Data analysis employs Spradley's componential analysis method, and the researcher verified the findings with an expert. The study identified 175 instances of Dothraki language in *Game of Thrones* Season 6, leading to the discovery of three distinct types of L3 translation rendering operations. There are 6 Delete L3<sup>ST</sup> (3,5%) in which the L3 in ST is omitted in TT, 16 Substitute L3<sup>ST</sup> → L2 (9,1%), which is divided into 2 conditions. There are condensation and inappropriate translation. The last is 153 Substitute L3<sup>ST</sup> (87,4%) which is divided into two conditions, defining the plot and emphasizing the characters, identity and story. The data shows that the most dominant rendering operation of L3 translation applied by the subtitler is Substitute L3<sup>ST</sup> because it is considered to be the most suitable operation that can be used as a solution in translating invented language. It is also because the subtitler accurately translated the third language into the target language, as evidenced by the consistency with the dictionary, dialogues, and scene narratives. The second finding of this research shows that there are 2 kinds of nature and degree of L3 presence. In this research, the researcher found 22 data (12,6%) of Lost which is divided into 6 causes, i.e: lack of duration, no full translation, accidental error, incorrect translation, unnecessary scene and unclear words. Also 153 data (87,4%) of Kept which is divided into 4 conditions; to define Khaleesi, define Dothraki, define Game of Thrones and define the context of the story. This means that the subtitler still wants to retain the meaning and the style of the third language

## INTRODUCTION

Movies are a form of literature that can incorporate multiple languages, including constructed ones specifically designed for fictional worlds. Constructed languages, as defined by Peterson (2015), are consciously created linguistic systems intended for artistic or functional use within creative works such as movies, books, or video games. Many fictional stories have constructed language which are only applied in the realm within the story. In *Harry Potter*, for example, there is a snake language called parcel tongue. Another popular fiction with constructed language is in story *Lord of the Rings*, where there are many kinds of creature, one of which are elves, who speak Sindarin and Quenya language



(Osoblivaia, 2023). Adelman (2013) contrasts these constructed languages with natural languages, emphasizing that they do not naturally evolve but are intentionally crafted. The practice of inventing languages has historical roots dating back to ancient times, gaining popularity notably during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries (Huseynova, 2015).

Translating invented languages into subtitles poses significant challenges for subtitlers due to the multilingual nature of the text. Constraints include unfamiliarity with the invented language (L3), the subtleties involved in rendering it effectively, adherence to subtitling standards (Karamitroglou, 1998), and other factors. According to Corrius and Zabalbeascoa (2011), when L3 appears in the original audiovisual text (ST), it may be omitted or adapted in the target text (TT). The approach to rendering L3 depends on audience familiarity with the language and whether the L3 in the ST is an invented language. This study aims to investigate the specific methods used by subtitlers to render L3 in *Game of Thrones Season 6* (2016) and the rationale behind their choices. *Game of Thrones* is a fictional drama series adapted from George R.R. Martin's book series *A Song of Ice and Fire*, featuring the Dothraki language spoken by a nomadic warrior race.

There has been some previous research on constructed language and the film. The most recent discussion on constructed language in fiction was written by Sabine Fiedler (2019) discussing two types of constructed languages, one that existed in real life which aim is to make communication easier, and another is language constructed by author of a fictional stories. Meanwhile, the series *Game of Thrones* has attracted many scholars. Larsson & Lundstrom (2020) discussed the anarchy in the series, connecting it to power struggles in international scope today. Similarly, Yu & Campbell (2020) also leadership theory presented in the film *Game of Thrones* as useful lesson for Master of Public Administration classroom. The translation of constructed language in the series *Game of Thrones* is the gap that will be filled through this research among the discussion of this popular series.

## LITERATURE REVIEW

### Translation

Translation is the act of conveying the meaning of a text from one language to another. According to Gottlieb (2001), translation involves the transformation of verbal elements in a text so that it can be comprehended and spoken by a new speech community in the target language. It means that it involves transferring the meaning from the source language into the target language to make it accessible and usable for speakers of the target language.

According to Venuti (2004), translation involves rewriting an original text, a process

that can lead to transformative impacts on literature, society, and the history of translation itself. Newmark (1981) defines translation as a craft focused on faithfully replacing a written message or statement in one language with an equivalent in another language. From these perspectives, translation can be understood as the practice of transferring the meaning of a written or spoken text from one language into another language while preserving its core message and intent. This process ensures that the essence of the original content remains intact despite linguistic and cultural differences.

### **Invented Language**

The concept of a third language, or L3, encompasses two main types: natural languages and invented or constructed languages. The practice of creating constructed languages has roots dating back to ancient times, with notable developments during the Middle Ages and the Renaissance. However, it gained significant popularity during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries (Huseynova, 2015). "Constructed language" term was first defined in 1928 by Otto Jespersen, a Danish linguist who created his own constructed language called Novial. It refers to a language deliberately invented by an individual, encompassing features such as phonetics, grammar, syntax, and occasionally a writing system.

Historically, two constructed languages have gained widespread recognition and adoption worldwide: Volapük (1880) and Esperanto (1887). These languages were developed with the intent of facilitating international communication and cultural exchange, each with its own structured grammar and vocabulary designed to be easy to learn and use universally. Their creation marked significant milestones in the development of constructed languages as tools for linguistic and cultural interchange on a global scale.

According to Peterson (2015), an invented language is any language that has been consciously devised by one or more individuals to the extent that it forms a complete and functional linguistic system, whether the intention was to create it or it evolved into such a system during the process. Adelman (2013) argues that constructed languages can be best understood in contrast to natural or ethnic languages. They are categorized into two main types. The first classification is based on their form: *a priori* and *a posteriori* languages. *A priori* languages are created entirely from scratch and bear little resemblance to any existing natural languages. In contrast, *a posteriori* languages incorporate elements from existing languages but modify them to suit specific purposes. The second classification is based on their communicative function. The largest group of constructed languages are designed as International Auxiliary Languages, intended to facilitate communication between speakers of

different native languages. Others are crafted purely for fictional purposes, existing only within imaginary worlds created by authors or creators. These constructed languages contribute unique depth and complexity to the fictional universes in which they are employed, enhancing the cultural and linguistic landscapes depicted in literature, film, or other creative media.

Meanwhile, Blanke (2004) prefers the term "planned language," defining it as languages deliberately created based on specific criteria primarily to enhance international communication. These languages are also known as international artificial languages, world auxiliary languages, or universal languages. From these explanations, it can be concluded that an invented language is one that is intentionally created rather than naturally evolved. It typically serves a specific purpose and is often found in works of fiction such as novels, films, or games. Examples include Esperanto, Quenya, Lojban, Lingua Ignota, among others..

### Rendering of L3 in Translation

Corrius and Zabalbeascoa (2011) have presented a method for addressing the issue of L3 translation through a rendering operation. This operation serves as a procedure employed by translators to effectively translate L3 into the target language. They define L1 as the primary language of the source text (ST), L2 as the primary language of the target text (TT), L3<sup>TT</sup> as the third language in the target text, and L3<sup>ST</sup> as the third language in the source text.

**Table 1**  
*Operation for L3<sup>ST</sup> segments*

No	Operation	L3 <sup>ST</sup> segment	L3 <sup>ST</sup> Status	Possible result/ effect
1.	Delete L3 <sup>ST</sup>	∅	Lost	Standardization
2.	Repeat L3 <sup>ST</sup> → L3 <sup>TT</sup> (when L3 <sup>ST</sup> ≠ L2)	L3 <sup>TT</sup> = L3 <sup>ST</sup>	Kept	Function or connotation may change
3.	Substitute L3 <sup>ST</sup> → L2 (when L3 <sup>ST</sup> ≠ L2)	∅	Lost	L3 invisibility, or L3 quality conveyed through some L2 strategy (e.g. talked about). Standardization, with or without compensation.
4.	Repeat L3 <sup>ST</sup> (when L3 <sup>ST</sup> = L2)	(L3 <sup>TT</sup> = L2)		

5.	Substitute $L3^{ST}$ (when $L3^{ST} \neq L2$ or $L3^{ST} = L2$ )	$L3^{TT} \neq \begin{Bmatrix} L3^{ST} \\ L2 \end{Bmatrix}$ $L3^{TT} \begin{Bmatrix} \neq \\ = \end{Bmatrix} L1$	Kept	Function or connotation may be equivalent or analogous
----	------------------------------------------------------------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	------	--------------------------------------------------------

The two columns in the middle show the nature and degree of L3 presence and visibility in the translation, whether it is lost or kept. The column headed “possible effect / result” on the right shows possible (but by no means all) effects and results of carrying out each operation as it affects the target text and its  $L3^{TT}$ , regardless of whether other problems may or may not have been solved (e.g. humor, character portrayal).

Based on the table above, Corrius and Zabalbeascoa (2011) classified the operation for  $L3^{ST}$  segments into 5 types, they are:

1. *Delete  $L3^{ST}$*

This means that the original text remains unchanged, resulting in no subtitles being displayed. The third language present in the source text is excluded from the target text, rendering the L3 content invisible and effectively nullifying its practical impact. As a consequence, this approach may lead to standardization.

2. *Repeat  $L3^{ST} \rightarrow L3^{TT}$*

It is when the L3 of the source text is different from the main language of the target text ( $L3^{ST} \neq L2$ ). The  $L3^{ST}$  is transferred unchanged and still retain the L3 status in the target text ( $L3^{TT} = L3^{ST}$ ), but the possible effect of this case is function or connotation may change. The example of this case is an intralingual subtitle.

3. *Substitute  $L3^{ST} \rightarrow L2$*

It is when the L3 of the source text is not the same with the main language of the target text ( $L3^{ST} \neq L2$ ).  $L3^{ST}$  is transferred into target text but not exactly the same with the actual meaning, means that the L3 is not retained in the target text. Thus, the status of the L3 in the target text is lost and becomes invisible.

4. *Repeat  $L3^{ST}$*

It is when the L3 of the source text coincides same with the main language of the target text ( $L3^{ST} = L2$ ). The  $L3^{ST}$  is transferred unchanged (and unnoticed) in the target text, means that it can’t be differentiated from the main language of the target text. Thus, the status of the L3 is lost.

5. *Substitute  $L3^{ST}$*

It is when the L3 of the source text is same with or different from the main language

of the target text ( $L3^{ST} \neq L2$  or  $L3^{ST} = L2$ ). It depends on the perspective of the audiences. Hence, L1 or any other language can be the L3 of the target language. In this case,  $L3^{ST}$  is adapted into the target language and the status of the L3 is kept. Furthermore, Corrius and Zabalbeascoa also classified the nature and degree of L3 presence and visibility in the translation into 2 types, they are:

1. *Lost*

The Lost status in the nature and degree of L3 presence happens when the translator or subtitler does not retain the  $L3^{TT}$  status and the  $L3^{TT}$  segment is  $L3^{TT} = L2$  or  $L3^{TT} = \emptyset$ .

2. *Kept*

The Kept status in the nature and degree of L3 presence happens when the translator or subtitler retains the  $L3^{TT}$  status and the  $L3^{TT}$  segments are  $L3^{TT} = L3^{ST}$ ,  $L3^{TT} \neq L3^{ST}$ ,  $L3^{TT} \neq L2$ ,  $L3^{TT} \neq L1$  or  $L3^{TT} = L1$ .

## RESEARCH METHOD

According to Moleong (1990: 3), qualitative descriptive research involves documenting observed data in written form. Therefore, this study utilizes a descriptive qualitative method to analyze how subtitlers in Game of Thrones Season 6 apply various rendering operations to L3 translation and the rationale behind their application. The research employs Corrius and Zabalbeascoa's theory of L3 translation rendering operations to categorize and explain these practices within the context of the show. Data for analysis are sourced from the script of Dothraki dialogues obtained from [www.wikidothraki.org](http://www.wikidothraki.org). The researcher ensures synchronization between the dialogues and their English translations using the script. Additionally, English translations are derived from hardsubs appearing on-screen in Game of Thrones Season 6, as well as fansubs provided by Lebah Ganteng (2016).

## FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

Dothraki is a race in *A Song of Ice and Fire* Novels by George R. R. Martin. He stated that Dothraki is inspired by the mixed of Mongols, Huns, Alans, Turks, Native American plains tribes, and various other nomadic horse-riding peoples who lived on the open steppe. They are depicted as a nomadic people inhabiting the continent of Essos, located east of Westeros across the Narrow Sea. Physically, characterized by strong, muscular bodies, tanned skin, dark eyes, and dark hair. The name "Dothraki" translates to "riders" in their language, reflecting their culture where they are born, live, and die on horseback.

The Dothraki language, created by David J. Peterson, is known for its harsh sound

characterized by frequent "kh" spellings, which produce a throaty sound that may sound harsh to English speakers. Actor Jason Momoa likened its sound to German, while others have compared it to Arabic or Russian. This study primarily focuses on analyzing different types of rendering operations in L3 translation and understanding why subtitlers choose specific rendering operations for translating Dothraki language in Game of Thrones Season 6. The data analyzed include words, sentences, phrases, and clauses spoken in Dothraki and their corresponding translations. The research identified a total of 175 instances of rendering operations in L3 translation and their reasons for application, which are summarized in a table for presentation of the results:

**Table 2**  
*Componential Table*

No.	Nature and Degree of L3 Presence	Rendering Operation					Number
		Del L3 <sup>ST</sup>	Rep L3 <sup>ST</sup> →L3 <sup>TT</sup>	Sub L3 <sup>ST</sup> →L2	Rep L3 <sup>ST</sup>	Sub L3 <sup>ST</sup>	
1.	Lost	6	-	16	-	-	22
2.	Kept	-	-	-	-	153	153
Total							175

Based on the table 2, the researcher found three types of rendering operation in L3 translation. There are Delete L3<sup>ST</sup>, Substitute L3<sup>ST</sup>→L2 and Substitute L3<sup>ST</sup>. Also, there are two kinds of reasons of the subtitler applies particular rendering operation. The first is Lost and the second is Kept.

### Types of rendering operation in L3 translation in *Game of Thrones Season 6*

#### *Deletion L3<sup>ST</sup>*

Deletion L3<sup>ST</sup> happens because the third language is not translated at all in to the target language. The subtitler does not apply subtitles on the screen, nor in English or Indonesian version. The third language in the source text is omitted in the target text. In this research, the researcher found 6 data (3.5%) of Deletion L3<sup>ST</sup> applied in *Game of Thrones season 6*. From these 6 data of Deletion L3<sup>ST</sup>, the researcher selected an example to illustrate the data analysis. Here is the example:

**Figure 1**

*Jorah sneaks in to Vaes Dothrak*



L3: Yer fich jinnaan loy nayati Saathoon?

Dothraki dictionary meaning: You bring any girls home from Saath?

L1: -

L2: -

There are no subtitles both in English or in Indonesian version, thus it makes the audiences don't know what the characters are talking about because the L3 is totally omitted by the subtitler. In this scene, Iggo and Akho are having a conversation. Here, Iggo asks Akho "Yer fich jinnaan loy nayati Saathoon?" which means "You bring any girls home from Saath?" meanwhile Jorah and Daario Naharis sneak in to save Khaleesi. They walk in silent so that Iggo and Akho do not catch them.

In this instance, the focus of the scene is primarily on the stealthy actions taking place rather than the conversation between Iggo and Akho. The scene portrays Jorah and Daario engaged in action, with the voices of Iggo and Akho conversing in the background. As their conversation does not significantly contribute to the scene and is deemed unnecessary, subtitles in both English and Indonesian are omitted. Despite the absence of subtitles, the plot remains easily understandable because the omitted dialogue does not impact the storyline in a substantial way.

*Substitute  $L3^{ST} \rightarrow L2$*

Substitute  $L3^{ST} \rightarrow L2$  happens because the third language is translated differentially from the source text or its actual meaning. Substitute The L3 of the ST is different from the main language of the TT ( $L3^{TT} \neq L2$ ) but L3 is not retained in the TT. The researcher discovered 16 data (9.1%) of Substitute  $L3^{ST} \rightarrow L2$  used in *Game of Thrones season 6*. The Substitute  $L3^{ST} \rightarrow L2$  operation is categorized into two conditions: condensation and



inappropriate translation.

Here are the examples of Substitute  $L3^{ST} \rightarrow L2$  operation with the case of condensation that applied by the subtitler in *Game of Thrones* Season 6:

**Figure 2**  
*Daenerys's dialogue*



L3: Anha laz vos odinak Vaesoon Dothrak vosecchi, vosm'anha ayothak vorsqoyoon ven fih kash anha adrivok.

Dothraki dictionary meaning: I can never leave Vaes Dothrak, unless I rise as smoke from the pyre on the day I die.

L1: I can never leave Vaes Dothrak, unless I rise as smoke from the pyre on the day I die.

L2: Aku takkan pernah meninggalkan Vaes Dothrak sampai aku mati.

The third language of the ST is different from the main language of the TT. The translation of the third language is not the same with the source text. The Indonesian subtitle is layering the English subtitle and the L3 is not retained in the TT. In the scene, Khaleesi tells Ornela that she cannot leave Vaes Dothrak unless she dies and her body is burned, allowing her spirit to rise as smoke from the funeral pyre. Khaleesi says "*Anha laz vos odinak Vaesoon Dothrak vosecchi, vosm'anha ayothak vorsqoyoon ven fih kash anha adrivok*" which means "I can never leave Vaes Dothrak, unless I rise as smoke from the pyre on the day I die" to convince Ornela that she will not run away from Vaes Dothrak.

In this case, there is sentence from the original dialogue that is removed and not translated into the TT. The subtitler does a condensation by translating the sentence into a simpler meaning. The sentence "*unless I rise as smoke from the pyre on the day I die*" is a phrase that only translated as "*sampai aku mati*" into the TT. Hence, the meaning of the L3 is not fully conveyed to the TT and makes this case is classified into the operation of Substitute  $L3^{ST} \rightarrow L2$ . Despite this, the overall plot remains understandable because the translation captures the essential meaning of the original dialogue.

Here is the example of Substitute  $L3^{ST} \rightarrow L2$  operation with the case of inappropriate translation that applied by the subtitler in *Game of Thrones* Season 6:

**Figure 3**

*Daenerys's dialogue*



L3: Anha avvirsā khadokh moon.

Dothraki dictionary meaning: I burnt his  
body. L1: I burnt his body.

L2: Aku mengubur jasadnya.

The scene shows that when Khaleesi is facing Khal Moro and having an argument about who she really is. Khaleesi explain that she was the wife of Khal Drogo and she burnt his body when Khal Drogo is dead. In this case, there is a word of the third language that is not translated correctly into the TT. That word is “*avvirsā*” which means “*burnt*” in English but it is translated as “*mengubur*” into Indonesia. It makes the meaning of the L3 is incorrect because this word should be translated into “*membakar*”. Hence, it makes the translation becomes inappropriate with the storyline because on the previous season when Khal Drogo died, his body is not buried but burned.

#### *Substitute $L3^{ST}$*

Substitute  $L3^{ST}$  happens because the third language is different from the target language ( $L3^{ST} \neq L2$ ) or same with the target language ( $L3^{ST} = L2$ ), it depends on the respective of the audiences. Thus, L1 or any other language might be used as the third language of the TT. In this research, the L3 is Dothraki, L1 is English and L2 is Indonesian. The third language is fully and correctly translated to the target language. In this research, the researcher discovered that 153 data (87.4%) of Substitute  $L3^{ST}$  were applied in *Game of Thrones season 6*. Substitute  $L3^{ST}$  is categorized into two conditions: the first involves defining the plot, and the second focuses on emphasizing the characters, their identities, and the story.

Here is the example of Substitute  $L3^{ST}$  operation with the case of defining the plot

that applied by the subtitler in *Game of Thrones* Season 6:

**Figure 4**

*Jorah's Dialogue*



L3: Kisha nemo silish Jereseroun Jima majin leisosh

Dothraki dictionary meaning: We wandered off from the Western Market and got lost

L1: We wandered off from the Western Market and got lost. L2:

Kami berjalan dari Western Market dan tersesat.

All the words in the dialogue of the third language is translated appropriately with its actual meaning. the Indonesian subtitle is layering the English subtitle, but even though the subtitles accumulate into one, the meaning of the third language is maintained.

In this scene, Jorah and Daario are discovered by Akho and Iggo as they attempt to rescue Khaleesi in Vaes Dothrak. To avoid suspicion, they deceive Akho and Iggo by pretending to be lost merchants seeking directions back. The subtitler ensures the integrity of the storyline by accurately translating the third language into the target language without altering its meaning or omitting any words. This faithful translation allows the audience to fully grasp that the characters' actions are a ruse to conceal their true intentions of sneaking into the city.

Here is the example of Substitute L3<sup>ST</sup> operation with the case of emphasizing the characters, their identities, and the story that applied by the subtitler in *Game of Thrones* Season 6:

**Figure 5**

*Khal Moro's Dialogue*



L3: Athira asshekhis mae ma khaleenisoa khali drivi

Dothraki dictionary meaning: To live out her days with the widows of dead khals

L1: To live out her days with the widows of dead khals

L2: Untuk menghabiskan waktu bersama para janda Khal.

This scene shows the dialogues between Khal Moro and his wives after knowing that Khaleesi is the widow of a dead Khals. They said that after the dead of the Khal, their widows have to stay at the Vaes Dothrak, the Temple of Dosh Khaleen. The subtitler emphasizes the identity of Dothraki by translating the third language completely and correctly into the target language. In this case, the identity of Dothraki is delivered clearly to the audiences that Dothraki have the kind of tradition that the wife of a dead Khal has to be the part of Dosh Khaleen in Vaes Dothrak. The dosh khaleen are composed of the widows of slain khals. They serve as seers foretelling the future, interpreting omens for the Dothraki and become the leader of Dothraki religion. They live in the holy city of Vaes Dothrak.

#### **Reason for applying particular rendering operation in L3 translation**

##### *Lost*

The Lost status in the nature and degree of L3 presence happens when the subtitler does not retain the  $L3^{TT}$  status and the  $L3^{TT}$  segment is  $L3^{TT} = L2$  or  $L3^{TT} = \emptyset$ . The Lost status is divided into 6 causes. There are lack of duration, no full translation, accidental error, incorrect translation, unnecessary scene and unclear words. Here are the examples of Lost status in the nature and degree of L3 presence:

**Figure 6**

*Iggo asks for help*



L3: Rhelas! Rhelas!

Dothraki dictionary meaning: Help! Help!

L1: -

L2: -

The status of third language is not retained and the  $L3^{TT}$  segment is  $L3^{TT} = \emptyset$ . In this case, the  $L3$  is totally omitted. There are no subtitles both in English or in Indonesian version, it means that the subtitler does not retain the integrity of the  $L3$  meaning and its style. In this scene, Jorah and Daario Naharis are caught by Akho and Iggo when they are sneaking out to the Vaes Dothrak. Akho is fighting with Jorah while Iggo is running to ask for help from the others but Daario Naharis already chased him and then killed him.

The subtitler opted for Lost in this instance because the scene unfolded quickly, resulting in the characters' dialogue being brief and fleeting. In response, the subtitler chose to omit the entire dialogue in the third language, effectively neutralizing its presence. This approach aims to standardize the viewing experience by minimizing the visibility of the third language. Despite the absence of subtitles, the storyline remains comprehensible as the context of the scene and the actors' body language clearly convey that a character is seeking assistance. Thus, the narrative continuity is maintained without relying on the dialogue that was omitted.

**Figure 7**  
*Bloodrider's Dialogue*



L3: Iffat krazaaj mesi k'oakahi.

Dothraki dictionary meaning: Forcing a half ton of muscle to submit to your will.

L1: Forcing it to submit to your will.

L2: memaksanya memenuhi keinginanmu.

In this scene, Khaleesi is thrilled by Dothraki. She is arguing with Khal Moro, then Khal Moro is insulting and harassing Khaleesi in front of his wives and another bloodriders. Khal Moro asked to the bloodriders "*seeing beautiful woman naked for the first time what is better than that?*" then one of the bloodrider answer by saying "*breaking a wild horse, forcing a half ton of muscle to submit your will*".

In the described scene, the subtitler opts not to fully translate the third language.

Instead, they condense the meaning to comply with subtitle standards, which typically limit each line to around 35 characters (Karamitroglou, 1998). The original phrase "a half to of muscle" is translated simply as "it," reducing the character count from 52 to meet these guidelines. This condensation causes the third language to lose visibility and diminishes its status as L3. However, despite this loss, the storyline remains comprehensible to the audience.

**Figure 8**

*Akho's dialogue*



L3: Me allayafa anna vasterat irge me nakhoe. Hash vos, hash kisha janaan.  
Dothraki dictionary meaning: I like to talk when I'm finished. Otherwise, wemight as well be dogs

L1: I like to talk when I'm finished. Otherwise, we might as well be dogs.

L2: Aku akan jalan kaki saat selesai, atau kita akan seperti anjing.

In this scene, Dothraki found Khaleesi in the middle of meadow alone, then they bring her to Vaes Dothrak. Along the way to Vaes Dothrak, Akho and Qhono insult Khaleesi. In the scene, Akho says "I like to talk when I'm finished. Otherwise, we might as well be dogs." but the subtitler translated it into "Aku akan jalan kaki saat selesai, atau kita akan seperti anjing". In this case, the word "talk" that means "berbicara" in Indonesian is translated as "jalan kaki" by the subtitler. It can be seen that the subtitler did an accidental error which is talk is translated as walk. This happens because those two words are sound similar in English.

From the explanation above, the subtitler does not retain the L3 status because he/she accidentally did an error. Thus, the third language loses its visibility. In this case, the narrative becomes inappropriate which is the narrative that seen by the audiences is not the same with the original narrative.



Figure 9. Khal Moro's dialogue

L3: Khaleesi Vosi,

Dothraki dictionary meaning: Queen of  
Nothing,

L1: Queen of Nothing,

L2: ...Tak ada gunanya...,

In this scene, Khaleesi explains about who she is to Khal Moro. She tells Khal Moro that she is Daenerys Stormborn of the House Targaryen, the First of Her Name, the Unburnt, Queen of Meereen, Queen of the Andals and the Rhoynar and the First Men, Khaleesi of the Great Grass Sea, Breaker of Chains and Mother of Dragons. But Khal Moro does not care with all of her names and calls her that she is a queen of nothing. In this case, the subtitler translate "Queen of nothing" into "taka da gunanya". It can be seen that the subtitler wrongly translated the address here.

From the explanation above, the subtitler does not retain the L3 status because he/she translated the third language without seeing the context of the scene. Hence, the L3 becomes invisible and considered as Lost its status of L3. The narrative becomes inappropriate which is the narrative that seen by the audiences is not the same with the original narrative.

**Figure 10**  
*Iggo's Dialogue*



L3: Ma hash rizh yeri norethqoyik?

Dothraki dictionary meaning: What if you have a son with red  
hair?

L1: -

L2: -

In this scene, Daario Naharis accompanies Jorah sneak in to Vaes Dothrakto save Khaalesi. While they are doing their action in silent, Akho and Iggoare walking pass by and having some conversation. They do not know if Jorahand Daario are sneaking in. In this case, the scene is more focused to the sneak in action of Jorah than to the conversation of Akho and Iggo. Based on the scene's context, the subtitler chose not to preserve the third language because the dialogue was deemed unnecessary. As a result, the third language lost visibility and its status was effectively nullified (Lost), leading to a situation where audiences may not understand what the characters are discussing.

**Figure 11**

*Dothraki Bloodriders*



L3: Qoy qoyi! Qoy qoyi!

Dothraki dictionary meaning: Blood of my blood! Blood of my blood!

L1: -

L2: -

In this scene, Khaleesi asks all of the Dothraki bloodriders (Dothraki warrior) to join her troops, then the Dothraki bloodriders say a phrase “*Qoy qoyi! Qoy qoyi!*” which means “Blood of my blood! Blood of my blood!” in English to show that they already admit that Khaleesi is now part of them and willing to be her bloodrider. In Dothraki the phrase “*Qoy qoyi!*” is an addressee that used by bloodriders and Khal/Khaleesi (King/Queen) to show that they are part of the same Khalasar (Dothraki clan or tribe).

Lost is applied by the subtitler because the words that said in the scene is unclear. It sounds unclear because there are like hundreds of blood riders exclaim “Qoy qoyi!” all together. Hence, the subtitler neutralized the third language by omitting the whole dialogue. Thus, the third language loses its visibility and the possible effect that appears is



standardization. It makes the audiences do not know what the character are talking about.

### *Kept*

The Kept status in the nature and degree of L3 presence happens when the translator or subtitler retains the L3<sup>TT</sup> status and the L3<sup>TT</sup> segments are  $L3^{TT} = L3^{ST}$ ,  $L3^{TT} \neq L3^{ST}$ ,  $L3^{TT} \neq L2$ ,  $L3^{TT} \neq L1$  or  $L3^{TT} = L1$ . The Kept status is applied by the subtitler to define the context of the scenes which is important to the plot development. The Kept status is divided into 4 conditions. There are to define Khaleesi, define Dothraki, define *Game of Thrones* and define the context of the story. Here are the examples of Kept status in the nature and degree of L3 presence:

**Figure 12**

*Khaleesi's dialogue*



L3: Anha Daenerys Vazyol h'Okreseroon Targaryen,

Dothraki dictionary meaning: I am Daenerys Stormborn of the House Targaryen,

L1: I am Daenerys Stormborn of the House Targaryen,

L2: Aku Daenerys Stormborn dari House Targaryen...,

The status of the third language is retained and the L3<sup>TT</sup> segments are  $L3^{TT} \neq L3^{ST}$ ,  $L3^{TT} \neq L2$  or  $L3^{TT} \neq L1$ . The sentence is translated correctly and fully conveyed without any omission. It means that the subtitler retains the integrity of the L3 meaning and its style. In this case, the third language is retained to define Khaleesi. In this scene, Khaleesi is brought to Khal Moro. Khaleesi explains to Khal Moro about who she is by mentioning all of her surname. She tells him that she is Daenerys Stormborn of the House Targaryen, the First of Her Name, the Unburnt, Queen of Meereen, Queen of the Andals and the Rhoynar and the First Men, Khaleesi of the Great Grass Sea, Breaker of Chains and Mother of Dragons.

In this case, the subtitler retains the third language because it is to define Khaleesi so that all of her names are delivered completely to the audiences. It is conveyed that Khaleesi is certainly a great woman. Hence, the third language does not lose its status and the possible effect that appears is the function or connotation is equivalent or analogous. The storyline

and the narriton remain intact without any missing.

**Figure 13**

*Qhono's dialogue*



L3: Hale, zhey Khaleesi Vezhven. Eyes choy

Dothraki dictionary meaning: Hey, Great Khaleesi. Move your ass.

L1: Hey, Great Khaleesi. Move your ass.

L2: Khaleesi Agung. Jalan.

In this scene, Khaleesi walks with all of Dothraki to the Vaes Dothrak. Qhono, one of the Dothraki bloodriders, commands Khaleesi in a harsh way to keep walking and then whip her. From this scene, it can be seen that Dothraki is a rude people. They like to treat other people badly, especially to people they consider to be slaves.

In this case, the subtitler retains the third language because it is to define Dothraki so that the image of Dothraki as a rude people is delivered completely to the audiences. Hence, the third language does not lose its status and the possible effect that appears is the function or connotation is equivalent or analogous. The storyline and the narration remain intact without any missing.

**Figure 14**

*Khaleesi's dialogue*



L3: Hash yeri vazhi anhaan Rhaeshis Andahli,

Dothraki dictionary meaning: Will you give me the Seven Kingdoms,

L1: Will you give me the Seven Kingdoms,

L2: Maukah kalian memberikan Seven Kingdoms padaku...

In this case, the subtitler maintains the third language to underscore the essence of *Game of Thrones*. During the scene, Khaleesi gathers all the Dothraki bloodriders and urges

them to join her cause. She tells them her ambitions to conquer the Seven Kingdoms by crossing the black salt sea, pledging loyalty and seeking their aid in eliminating her enemies. The subtitler's decision to retain the third language serves to emphasize that *Game of Thrones* revolves around the struggle for power and supremacy. This thematic message is effectively conveyed to the audience through Khaleesi's dialogue, ensuring that the third language retains its significance and aligns closely with its original function or connotation. As a result, the storyline and narrative coherence remain preserved without any essential details being lost.

**Figure 15**

*Khal Moro's dialogue*



L3: Anha asshekh yera vaesishoon, zhey Khaleesi

Dothraki dictionary meaning: Welcome home, khaleesi

L1: Welcome home, khaleesi.

L2: Selamat datang kembali, Khaleesi.

In this scene, Khaleesi and Dothraki finally arrive at Vaes Dothrak, the city of Dothraki. Khal Moro greets Khaleesi by saying “*Anha asshekh yera vaesishoon, zhey Khaleesi*” which means “Welcome home, khaleesi”. He says like that because finally she comes back to the place where she belongs.

Here, the subtitler retains the third language because it is to define the context of the story that Khaleesi ever came to this place and then she comes back to it again. The subtitler translates the third language by adapting it into the target text. It means that the third language retains its visibility. Thus the data number 59 is considered as Kept its L3 status and the possible effect that appears is the function or connotation is equivalent or analogous. The storyline and the narration remain intact without any missing.

## DISCUSSION

Among the five types of L3 rendering operations, the Substitute L3<sup>ST</sup> becomes the most frequent type that applied. This approach is considered the most suitable solution for translating the third language, as seen in *Game of Thrones* Season 6. The third language has

no native speakers and cannot be directly matched with the target language as in the case of natural languages. Therefore, substituting L3<sup>ST</sup> allows subtitlers to convey the meaning and essence of the third language effectively while ensuring comprehension for viewers in the target language. This methodological choice underscores the complexity of translating invented languages in audiovisual media, where maintaining narrative coherence and authenticity while adapting to linguistic and cultural differences is paramount. Here, subtitlers aim to bridge these gaps and enable audiences to fully engage with the intricate fictional worlds depicted in the series, preserving both the linguistic integrity and storytelling nuances crafted by the creators.

Regarding the findings of the reason of the subtitler applies particular rendering operation in L3 translation, the dominant of the nature and degree of L3 presence that applied by the subtitler is Kept. Even though the third language is an invented language, the subtitler still want to retain the meaning and the style of the third language by adapting it to the target language. It is because the subtitler does not want to cease all the practical purpose of the L3, given that there are many scenes that appear in *Game of Thrones Season 6* that consist of a third language and the third language is mostly important for the plot development. Thus, the third language does not lose its visibility and the function or connotation may be equivalent or analogous.

The goal is to preserve the original context, storyline, and narrative of the movie, ensuring that all its narrative elements—such as characters, characterization, plot, setting, point of view, theme, and style—are clearly conveyed to the audience. In this research, the subtitler maintains the integrity of the third language to define crucial aspects of the series like *Game of Thrones* and the Dothraki culture, which are central to the story. By retaining the status of the third language, the subtitler aims to communicate that *Game of Thrones* revolves around a struggle for power and dominance. Additionally, the subtitler portrays the Dothraki as a fierce and aggressive people through their harsh language and confrontational behavior towards others. Ultimately, the subtitler's objective is to ensure that all aspects of the story involving the third language are fully understood by the audience, allowing them to grasp the storyline comprehensively without missing any details.

## CONCLUSION

Based on the research findings discussed, three main types of L3 translation operations were identified among subtitlers working on *Game of Thrones* Season 6: deleting the original L3 (L3ST), substituting L3ST with the target language (L2), and adapting L3ST

through substitution. Substitution of L3ST emerged as the predominant method due to its effectiveness in conveying the meaning of the third language while making it accessible to viewers in the target language. The other reason is because the subtitler mostly translated the third language correctly to the target language. It can be seen from the translation which is in accordance with the dictionary, dialogs, and the narrative in each scene.

Furthermore, the study identified two primary characteristics influencing the subtitlers' choice of L3 translation operations: retention (Kept) and omission (Lost) of L3ST elements. Retention was the more prevalent approach, allowing subtitlers to maintain the narrative essence and stylistic elements of the original language, such as the unique Dothraki language in *Game of Thrones*. This approach ensures that crucial aspects of the series, including characters, plot intricacies, settings, themes, and stylistic nuances, are faithfully conveyed to the audience without loss or misunderstanding.

In essence, these translation strategies not only facilitate comprehension of the series across different linguistic audiences but also preserve the integrity and richness of the original fictional world crafted by the creators of *Game of Thrones*.

## REFERENCES

- Adelman, M. (2014). Constructed Languages and Copyright: A Brief History and Proposal for Divorce. *Harvard Journal of Law & Technology*, 27(2).
- Blanke, D. (2004). *Interlinguistics and Esperanto studies: Paths to the scholarly literature*. Universala Esperanto-Asocio. <https://doi.org/10.1075/lplp.27.2.05bla>
- Creswell, J. W. (2003). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed. Methods Approaches Second Edition*. Sage Publications.
- Derdzinski, R. (n.d.). *Tolkien's Languages in the FotR Movie*. Retrieved August 2, 2019, from [http://www.elvish.org/gwaith/movie\\_elvish.htm](http://www.elvish.org/gwaith/movie_elvish.htm)
- Fiedler, S. (2019). Planned languages and languages created for fantasy and science-fiction literature or films: A study on some points of contact. *Język. Komunikacja. Informacja*, 19, (139-154), <https://cejsh.icm.edu.pl/cejsh/element/bwmeta1.element.ojs-issn-1896-9585-year-2019-issue-14-article-22646>
- Ganteng, L. (n.d.). subtitle. Retrieved from [www.subscene.com](http://www.subscene.com)
- Gbrich, C. (2007). *Qualitative Data Analysis: an Introduction*. Sage Publication.

- Gottlieb, H. (2001). Texts, Translation and Subtitling – In Theory, and in Denmark. *University of Copenhagen*.
- Haroon, H., & Daud, N. (2017). The translation of foreign words in an English novel into Malay. *GEMA Online® Journal of Language Studies*, 17(1), <http://doi.org/10.17576/gema-2017-1701-10>
- HBO. (2011). *Game of Thrones*. Retrieved from <https://www.hbo.com/game-of-thrones>
- Huseynova, S. (2015). Constructed Language: ESPERANTO. *ResearchGate*.
- Iberg, S. (2018). A Game of Languages: The Use of Subtitle for Invented Language in *Game of Thrones*. In I. Ranzato, & S. Zanotti, *Linguistic and Cultural Representation in Audiovisual Translation* (pp. 185-199). Routledge.
- Karamitroglou, F. (1998). A proposed set of subtitling standards in Europe. *Translation journal* 2.2, 1-15, <https://translationjournal.net/journal/04stndrd.htm>
- Larsson, S., & Lundstrom, M. (2020). Anarchy in the *Game of Thrones*. *Neohelicon*, 47, pp. 117-129. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11059-020-00522-5>
- Mäkelä, O. (2015). Constructed fictional language in translation Conveying Nadsat from A Clockwork Orange to Kellopetiappelsiini. *Thesis*. University of Vaasa.
- Moleong, L. (1990). *Metodelogi Penelitian Kualitatif*. CV. Remaja.
- Moleong, L. J. (2006). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Montse, C., & Zabalbeascoa, P. (2011). Language Variation in Source Texts and Their Translations: The Case of L3 in Film Translation . *Target* 23, 1, 113- 130.
- Newmark, P. (1981). *Approaches to Translation* . Oxford: Pergamon Press.
- Official HBO Press Release. (n.d.). Retrieved from <http://dothraki.conlang.org/official-hbo-press-release/>
- Osoblivaia, T. (2023). *The Middle Earh Languages of J.R.R. Tolkien*. PoliLingua. <https://www.polilingua.com/blog/post/middle-earth-languages-of-jrr-tolkien.htm#:~:text=Sindarin%20and%20Quenya%20are%20two,into%20distinct%20dialects%20over%20time>.
- Pedersen, J. (2005). How is culture rendered in subtitles. *MuTra 2005–Challenges of Multidimensional Translation: Conference Proceedings*, 1-18.
- Pedersen, J. (2011). *Subtitling norms for television*. John Benjamin Publishing Company.
- Peterson, D. (2015). *The Art of Language Invention: From Horse-Lords to Dark Elves, the Words Behind World-Building*. Penguin Books.
- Santosa, R. (2017). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif Kebahasaan*. UNS Press.

- Season Six Dothraki Dialogue*. (n.d.). Retrieved from Dothraki Wiki:  
[https://wiki.dothraki.org/Season\\_Six\\_Dothraki\\_Dialogue](https://wiki.dothraki.org/Season_Six_Dothraki_Dialogue)
- Sepielak, K. (2014). Translation techniques in voiced-over multilingual feature movies. *Linguistica Antverpiensia, New Series. Themes in Translation Studies*, 13, 251-272.
- Spradley, J. P. (1980). *Participant Observation*. Holt, Rinehart and Winston.
- UNAIDS. (2010). *An Introduction to Triangulation*. UNAIDS.
- Venuti, L. (2004). *The Translator's Invisibility*. Routledge
- Yu, H.H., & Campbell, T.M. (2020). Teaching leadership theory with television: Useful lessons from *Game of Thrones*. *Journal of Public Affairs Education*, 27(2), pp. 141-175. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15236803.2020.1746137>