



Gender Construction in Manhaj Salaf's Account: A Study of Hadith Content on the Existence of Women in Public Sphere

Muhammad Mundzir

Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga, Yogyakarta

email: munmundzir@gmail.com

Abstract

This paper aims to discuss the gender construction of the 'Manhaj Salaf' account which regularly posts religious narratives containing hadith. The author specifically tried to read the gender construction of this account through the hadiths about the existence of women. In this case, the author read the contents carefully, then analyzed it with discourse analysis theory and classified it according to the typology of gender discrimination. In addition, the author also look at the implications and effects of the content on the lives of social media users. This study concluded that the Manhaj Salaf account has a bias understanding in narrating the content of hadith, especially about the existence of women. This is proven by its textual and subjective understanding in it. It also raises a negative and positive implications for social media users.

Keywords:

Construction, Women's Hadith, Manhaj Salaf, Gender

Abstrak

Tulisan ini bermaksud mendiskusikan tentang konstruksi gender dari akun "Manhaj Salaf", yang secara rutin memposting narasi agama yang bermuatan hadis. Penulis secara spesifik mencoba membaca konstruksi gender akun "Manhaj Salaf" melalui hadis-hadis tentang eksistensi perempuan. Dalam hal ini, penulis membaca konten-konten tersebut secara cermat, kemudian menganalisisnya dengan teori analisis wacana dan mengklasifikasikan sesuai tipologi diskriminasi gender. Selain itu, penulis juga akan melihat implikasi dan pengaruh dari konten tersebut terhadap kehidupan pengguna media sosial. Kajian ini menyimpulkan bahwa akun "Manhaj Salaf" memiliki pemahaman yang bias dalam menarasikan konten hadis, khususnya tentang eksistensi perempuan. Hal ini dibuktikan dengan pemahamannya yang tekstualis dan subjektif.

Hal tersebut juga memunculkan implikasi negatif dan positif bagi pengguna media sosial.

Kata Kunci:

Konstruksi, Hadis Perempuan, Manhaj Salaf, Gender

Introduction

Hadith discourse on social media continues to experience dynamics and still recently being studied by contemporary hadith scholars. It comes from the fact that the delivery of religious narratives using verses or hadiths on social media, is not merely to preach religion, but also to deliver certain ideology in each post (Miski, 2017). In addition, religious content related to gender discourse has also become a topic that is widely discussed by social media users. However, not all social media accounts have a discourse on equality in their posts, so the content posted unconsciously contains narratives to discredit women (Ulya, 2020). This then raises a gap, where religious content which usually contains the value of moderation (*al-Wasatiyyah*), the value of freedom (*al-Hurriyah*), and the value of equality (*al-Musawah*), is often ignored by social media.

One of the social media accounts that has an interest in religious content, especially in narrating women is the “*Manhaj Salaf*” account. (Salaf, 2021). The account tries to explore verses, hadiths, and the opinions of scholars to respond the current issues. One of the issues that was mentioned was about the level of women existence in public. The account posted meme content with the *framing*: “*Being a Housewife Doesn’t Have To Be Sad and Insecure*”. In the caption, the post refers to a hadith which explains that women are aurat, and women who are closest to Allah are the ones who stay at home. The post received 2,724 likes from other Instagram accounts and has received 20 comments (Salaf, 2021b). This phenomenon evokes the writer’s interest to read the gender construction of the “*Manhaj Salaf*” account, because reading from the conclusion of their *caption*, this account indirectly uses religious narratives to legitimate inequality for women by limiting their existence in public.

There are several reasons why Manhaj Salaf's account is interesting to study. *First*, the account has more popularity than other accounts, and this can be seen from the number of *likes* on their contents. *Second*, the account has been consistent in posting the Qur'an and Hadith genres, especially the ones related to women.

This study will further explore the content of religious narratives posted on the "Manhaj Salaf" account, especially hadith content that narrates the existence of women in the public sphere. The author will then read the gender construction of the account and see the implications of the posted content. Thus, there are two questions proposed in this study, *first*, how is the gender construction of the "Manhaj Salaf" account in the presentation of hadith content about the existence of women in the public sphere? *Second*, how is the influence of hadith content on the existence of women in the public sphere for social media users? For these two questions, the author will classify them based on the typology of gender discrimination by Mansour Fakih.

This research is related to the three previous related studies. *First*, research on gender construction in the media, either *online* or *offline* (newspapers, novels, magazines). Some of these studies illustrate that the study of gender construction has commenced a new era where not all media advocate equality in viewing women. This is also due to the existence of the media which is still subordinate and gives stereotypes to women (Astuti, 2016, 2018; Nastiti and Basri, 2019; Primasari, 2017; Rosyidah and Nurwati, 2019). *Second*, a study on the existence of women posted by social media accounts. Some of these studies conclude that not all social media accounts have a vision of upholding women's equality, but there are also accounts that do not provide space for women to exist in the public sphere. Ideology and background are highly influencing these accounts to post their contents (Mukaromah, 2020; Syahridawaty and Qudsy, 2019; Ulya, 2020). *Third*, research that narrates the existence of women in the public sphere, especially in hadith. Some of these studies concluded that women have a big role in building world civilization, as

presented by the figure of Khadijah who had a big role in the life of the Prophet Muhammad. In addition, women also have the right to develop their potential to appear in public spaces (Abdul Kodir, 2019; Damanhuri, 2016; Hasan, 2019; Kodir, 2011).

This paper will fill in the gap of several previous studies, since there has not been a specific study examining gender construction in the content of social media accounts, especially the “Manhaj Salaf” account. The author assumes that every social media user has a different purpose in using it, such as showing their expression, ideological identity, politics, and even religion. This goal then has an impact on other social media users, either a positive or negative influence.

Overview of “Manhaj Salaf” Account

Manhaj Salaf is a combination of two words المنهج and السلف. the word “*Manhaj*” is a form of *isim mashdar* from the word نهج which means to process, so the meaning of منهج is a process. This process is then developed into a meaningful method, procedure, way, or path. Diction منهج has a synonym in the form of منهاج which is also the name of *mashdar* from ينهج أنهج. Literally, either منهج or منهاج have the same meaning, namely a clear path (Ibn Manzur, 1414) . The diction of السلف literally means “the former”. However, if attributed to a time, the meaning of “salaf” refers to the Prophet Muhammad, his companions, tabiin and the four imams of the sect, namely Imam Malik, Imam Hanafi, Imam Syafi’i, and Imam Hambali (Adz-Dzahabiy, 1997, 21). Thus, “Manhaj Salaf” has a definition as a method or way of thinking that is attributed to the four schools, in which the legal inference always adheres to the Qur’an and hadith. The group that uses “Manhaj Salaf” is often referred to as Salafi.

Manhaj Salaf social media account is a social media account that explores religiously charged content guided by the Qur’an, hadith, the opinion of scholars, and the opinion of ustadz. The Manhaj Salaf account uses at least several other social media platforms to distribute its contents,

including Manhaj Salaf (*facebook*) followed by 39,579 facebook users, @ittibarasul1 and @salafimengaji (*instagram*) followed by 92,800 and 1071 instagram account users respectively, Manhaj Salaf TV (*youtube*) with 6,470 subscribers, dakwahmanhajsalaf.com (*website*), ittibarasul1 (*twitter*) followed by 1,590 twitter account users, Manhaj Salaf (*telegram*) in the form of a group channel with 45,474 members, and *Whatsapp Group* which is divided into two, namely Manhaj Salaf Ikhwan and Manhaj Salaf Akhwat.¹The Manhaj Salaf account does not run on its own, yet it was built by three ustadz, namely Ustadz Berik Said² and Ustadz Abu Abdurrahman.³

The author has not found valid data regarding the history of the establishment of the Manhaj Salaf account, but if traced from the date of its Telegram group *channel* first appeared, this account has existed since March 8, 2018, while the first Instagram post appeared on February 19, 2020. In spreading its content, the Manhaj account Salaf uses the duration of one day one content. In addition, several typologies in his posts include: memes containing the Qur'an or hadith by mentioning actual issues; memes that narrate the opinions of scholars regarding law; articles that have a correlation with content on Instagram; and book studies *uploaded* on the youtube *channel*.

Generally, the content distributed by the Manhaj Salaf account is in the form of : *'ubudiyah, amaliyyah, aqeeda*, motivation, and ideology. Though it has a complex level of variance, Manhaj Salaf's account has consistency in holding the principle of being guided by the Qur'an and hadith, so that every post that is distributed has at least a tendency of verses, hadiths, or the opinions of scholars who are guided by the Qur'an and hadith. This consistency has caused Manhaj Salaf's account to become a place

1 This data was accessed on September 26, 2021, at 22:20 WIB.

2 Berik Said the board of directors in the movement of the Manhaj Salaf account. He is active as a speaker in Salafi studies in Indramayu, he is also a coach at Indonesian Muslim Bikers (MBI) in Indramayu.

3 Abdurrahman's full name is Abu Abdurrahman Ainurrahman bin Muhammad Suud al-Atsari. He was born in Sidoarjo and is active in reviewing Manhaj Salaf's account and is also an MUI cadre from East Java.

for religious learning for social media users. Social media users tend to consume instant information without exploring deeper into the reliability of the source and epistemological attachment of a content. (Soliha, 2015).

Hadith Content of the Existence of Women in the “Manhaj Salaf” Account

Manhaj Salaf’s account has a fairly complex content variety, ranging from memes, articles, and videos. The genres are not only focusing on one issue, but almost all issues that currently become hot topics in Indonesia will be responded with verses from the Qur’an or hadith. However, this research is limited to hadith content, which discusses the existence of women in the public sphere. Some of these contents are summarized in table I :

No	Hadis	Judul Konten	Jenis Konten	Tanggal Postingan	Comment dan Like
1	Wanita adalah Aurat	- <i>“Jadi Ibu Rumah Tangga Tak Perlu Sedih dan Minder”</i>	Meme	24 September 2021	2769 like dan 20 Komentar
		- <i>Hukum Seorang Wanita Memajang Foto sebagai PP (Picture Profile) di Jejaring Sosial, Sekalipun Berjilbab maupun Niqab</i>	Broadcast Chat ¹	4 Mei 2018	T i d a k Diposting di Instagram
		- <i>Ukthi Fotomu bisa Menjadi Sumber Dosa</i>	Meme	31 Mei 2021	4368 Like, 122 Komentar
2	Perempuan Sumber Fitnah	- <i>Larangan Wanita Bercadar dan Wanita Berhijab menjadi Model Pakaian</i>	Broadcast Chat	14 Juli 2018	
		- <i>Saudariku Jangan Upload Fotomu</i>	Meme	25 September 2020	5220 Like, 45 Komentar
		- <i>Bermanhaj Salaf itu Berat, Bagi Mereka yang Mendablukan Hawa Nafsunya</i>	Broadcast Chat	29 Januari 2019	T i d a k Diposting di Instagram

3	W a n i t a Menggunakan Parfum	- <i>Larangan Wanita Memakai Parfum Beraroma Wangi</i>	Broadcast Chat	9 Agustus 2018	T i d a k Diposting di Instagram
		- <i>Harum Tapi Haram</i>	Meme	24 Juni 2020	18.246 Like, 371 Komentar
		- <i>Hukum Pewangi Pakaian bagi Wanita</i>	Video Youtube	9 Desember 2020	13 Like, 196x Ditonton
		- <i>Hukum Pewangi Pakaian bagi Wanita</i>	Video Instagram	16 Desember 2020	4396 Tayangan, 1 Komentar
		- <i>Ketika Wanita Memakai Kosmetik Beralkohol</i>	Broadcast Chat	2 Desember 2018	T i d a k Diposting di Instagram
4	(Pemuliaan F a t h i m a h – Apa yang Paling Baik bagi Wanita?)	<i>Wanita itu Semakin Disembunyikan Semakin Baik</i>	Broadcast Chat	4 September 2018	T i d a k Diposting di Instagram
5	W a n i t a Bani Israil mengenakan Alas Kaki	<i>Haram Wanita Memakai Sepatu Hak Tinggi</i>	Broadcast Chat	23 Juni 2020	
			Meme	25 Juni 2020	9.971 Like, 232 Komentar
6	K e l u a r n y a Wanita Ansar Mengenakan Kain Hitam	<i>Wajibkah Wanita Berpakaian Hitam</i>	Broadcast Chat	14 Maret 2019	T i d a k Diposting di Instagram

Table I: Content types

The above table illustrates that the content about the existence of women in the public sphere has received enough attention for Manhaj Salaf's account. The data above was collected by using the keywords "women, women, wives" which were explored from several social media platforms, such as Instagram, *WhatsApp Group*, Telegram, Manhaj Salaf TV Youtube Channel, and articles on the *manhajsalaf.com* website. The hadith content discussing the existence of women in the public sphere has at least appeared since May 4, 2018 and the last related content was found on September 24, 2021. The six contents classified by the author above represent the entire content of Manhaj Salaf's account about women who are prohibited from appearing in public.

Gender Construction of “Manhaj Salaf” Account in Hadith Content of Women’s Existence

Gender analysis is an important tool to dissect a text, a phenomenon, or a discourse. This analysis is important to do in order to find out the position of women in real life. It is due to the fact that gender inequality still often arises from several discourses in the name of religion. Additionally, there is an inappropriate affirmation in relation to the gender which is often understood as God-given nature.

The issues that are often raised in cases of gender injustice include: marginalization which means impoverishment, subordination which means that women do not have the same rationality as men, negative stereotypes including inappropriate labeling attached to women, violence in the form of attacks and invasions to certain identity, and the double burden which means that besides bearing God-given nature, women are not given an option but to carry burdens that should be shared together with men (Fakih, 2013, 13–22).

The following explanation is a classification that is taken from the content of the hadith in the Manhaj Salaf account. This classification is essential to be displayed as it shows the existence of interests, including politics, ideology or even gender bias. This can be seen from the discourse and narrative presented (Eriyanto, 2011, 13–14).

Hadith about Women is Aurat



Picture 1



Picture 2

The first hadith used by the Manhaj Salaf account is a hadith that textually narrates women as aurat. This Hadith is used in three contents: 1) "Being a Housewife Doesn't Have to be Sad and Insecure"; 2) "Your photo can be a source of sin"; 3). "The Law of a Woman Displaying a Photo as a PP (Picture Profile) in Social Networks, Even in a Hijab or Niqab". In the narration of the first post, Manhaj Salaf's account proposes several interpretations of the Qur'anic verse about the virtues of women being at home or being housewives. This argument is based on the hadith which asserts that women are identical with the aurat. Since women are aurat, they should not appear outside. Instead, a good woman is a woman who takes care of herself. In addition, there is a comparison made in the account which states that career women who are in the office are more likely to have a free interaction with their male colleagues and are not self-conscious (Salaf 2021b).

The second content in the form of a meme was uploaded on May 31, 2021, it received 4368 *likes* and there were 122 comments. In its *caption*, Manhaj Salaf's account asserts that women are a source of slander and temptation for men. This argument is based on the hadith about women being a source of slander, women are aurat, and women as the source of male temptation that is attributed to Bani Israil. In its narrative, the account explains that the slander will be even greater when women upload their faces to the internet which can be seen by millions of men. In addition, the account also confirms that beautiful women are the real source of slander (Salaf, 2021a).

Hadith of women is aurat, also becomes legitimacy for the third content that states it is not allowed for women to post a photo of themselves into a social media. According to the Manhaj Salaf account, this prohibition is one of the implementations of *Sadd al-Dzari'ah* rules, namely closing the negative gap. This was later validated by the words of Shaykh 'Ali al-Qaari who explained that the devil beautifies women in men's eyes, and it is also supported by the hadith about women being a source of slander. Thus, all parts of a woman's body that appear in the

photo can be a chance for the devil to make it as a tool to attract men's eyes ⁴.

The hadith "women are aurat" which is referred to in some of the contents above is stated in the Book of Sunan al-Tirmidhi, No: 1173 (At-Turmudziy, 1994) This hadith was declared authentic by al-Albaniy, but al-Turmudzi emphasized that the hadith was *hasan sabih gharib*. The quality of the hadith proposed by al-Turmudzi is due to the fact that there is only one narrator who narrates from the companions to the tabi'in group, namely Ibn Mas'ud. Understanding this hadith is often associated with the hadith about "women are the source of slander". Over time, this understanding also develops. The narrative of women who leave the house is criticized that their identity is aurat and becomes a slander for those around them. This kind of understanding has indirectly limited and at the same time narrowed the movement of women. In fact, slander can basically occur from two parties, both men and women. So, it not only women, but also men who need to take care of themselves. Besides, it is protection of others that needs to be highlighted (Abdul Kodir, 2019). Thus, both men and women have the same obligation to protect themselves and prevent negative things to happen.

The narrative created by Manhaj Salaf's account is an expression based on the reality in this society, where women are allowed to appear in public and the administrator of this account wants to respond to this phenomenon. These expressions are then integrated with religious texts. However, this expression ignores human values since it considers women as fully 'aurat'. Women are considered inappropriate to leave the house and show their existence as a human being. In gender discourse, the content explored by the Manhaj Salaf Account regarding the expression 'women are 'aurat' is included in the typology of gender discrimination with stereotypes. This is based on the label that women are completely 'aurat' and the source of temptation. They suggest that women do not show their

⁴ Broadcast from Telegram Channel Manhaj Salaf, which was aired on May 4, 2018.

existence in the public sphere. This view, however, contradicts the spirit of human creation in the Qur'an, where women and men were created to know each other (*li ta'arafuu*).

Hadith about Women Sources of Slander

The second hadith used by the Manhaj Salaf Account is the hadith about "women are the source of slander". There are two contents being shared, first 1) *"Prohibition for women in niqab and women in hijab as clothing models"*; 2) *"Sister Don't Upload Your Photo!!"*. First, the content of women who ask, "What is the law for a woman who wears hijab but she works as a model?". Ust. Agus Santoso as the representative of Manhaj Salaf account answered that it is prohibited for women to become models as they show their beauty of their face and their body.⁵ Second, the content of the Instagram meme which emphasizes that women are the biggest temptation for men. Women are ordered to be aware so as not to be a slander for men. To strengthen this argument, the manhaj salaf account added QS Ali Imran: 14 and QS An-Nur: 30-31, and ended the post with the hadith about "fitnah (temptation) left by the Prophet is women"

The hadith about "women are the source of slander" actually has a fairly strong correlation when compared to the hadith "women are aurat", because the diction of aurat which is labeled to women has implications for accusations that women are sources of slander. This logic leads to the assumption that women do not appear in public. The hadith was narrated by Sulaiman al- Taymiy and agreed by al-Bukhari and Muslim.⁶ The Manhaj Salaf account takes the hadith literally and ignores the human aspect in its meaning. The diction of slander that the Prophet *wrote* to women should be the starting point for further understanding that both women and men can potentially become slander for other people. The understanding that

5 Broadcast of Telegram Channel Manhaj Salaf, shared on 14 July 2018.

7 حَدَّثَنَا آدَمُ حَدَّثَنَا شُعْبَةُ عَنْ سُلَيْمَانَ التَّيْمِيِّ قَالَ سَمِعْتُ أَبَا عَثْمَانَ النَّهْدِيَّ عَنْ أُسَامَةَ بْنِ زَيْدٍ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُمَا عَنِ النَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ قَالَ مَا تَزَكَّتْ بَعْدِي فِتْنَةٌ أَضَرَّ عَلَى الرَّجَالِ مِنَ النِّسَاءِ

should be conveyed to the readers is the awareness of negative things that can lead a person to slander without discriminating women by stating that women are the sources of slander (Abdul Kodir, 2019) .

The narratives conveyed in several posts on Manhaj Salaf's account ultimately sparked controversy. This is due to the labeling of women as sources of slander. In addition, indirectly, the narrative denies the view that men also have the potential to cause slander. Thus, the negative labeling content is included in the classification of discrimination against women with stereotypes. This is contrary to the principle of moderation in the Qur'an, that the posted content – especially in the name of religion – should carry messages that are humanist and should not discriminate against men or women. However, this message is ignored by the Manhaj Salaf account by only adhering to a literal understanding without any reinterpretation of classical texts that have their respective contexts.

3. Hadith Encyclopedia (or Al -Bayan) The Women of the Ansar Came Out with a Black Cloth on Her Head

Another hadith related to women is a hadith about ‘ the women of Ansar came out looking as if there were crows on their heads. ‘ The hadith is used as a basis of the content entitled “*Should Women Wear Black?*”. In his narrative, the Manhaj Salaf account does not explicitly recommend women to wear black. The author conveys this because there is a narration from al-Albani that allows Muslim women to wear dresses in bright colors. Although permissible, the Manhaj Salaf account still gives a better view to women, that good clothing is clothing that does not show jewelry and does not attract men, so black is the option. This is based on the hadith narrated by Umm Salamah who explains the *asbab al-nuzul* from QS al-Nur: 31, that the Anshar woman wears a black cloth to wrap her head when she leaves her house. The hadith about the Anshar woman coming out with a black cloth on her head is narrated by Sunan Abu Dawud :

4101 (As-Sijistaniy, n.d)⁷ This hadith is considered saheeh by al-Albaniy. The hadith is used as the main evidence to legitimize the obligation to wear black for Muslim women. This narrative seems to limit women to dress other than black. In fact, there is no definitive narrative about the obligation of women to dress in black (Abd al-Muhsin, n.d). The hadith gives the understanding that it is important to keep each other's gaze from everything that will cause *madllarat*. Such an understanding provides space for women to dress as they wish without intending to *tabarruj* or show off jewelry that is not normally visible.

In this case, although Manhaj Salaf account provides space for women to dress brightly, the narrative conveyed in their post is showing discrimination with stereotypes. This is based on the following narration “*Therefore, when going out of the house, women should wear dark, dull and uncolorful clothes so as not to attract people's eyes.*” In this narrative, it is explained that women who dress brightly can attract people's eyes. This hadith is understood literally without paying attention to the socio-historical context that every society has its own context. In Indonesian context, for example, people who wear all black can, in fact, attract more attention. Therefore, what is prioritized in understanding the hadith is about covering the aurat, and not about the style and color as the standards of each culture may vary and it will evolve through times.

Hadith about Women Who Wear Perfume

The next hadith that becomes the content of the Manhaj Salaf Account is a hadith about women wearing perfume. The narrative contents related to this hadith are, for example: “*Prohibition for Women to Wear Fragrant Perfume*”; *When Women Use Alcoholic Cosmetics*; Meme “*Fragrant But Haram.*”; *Law of Using Clothing Fragrance for Women – Ustadz Ahmad*

⁷ حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ، حَدَّثَنَا ابْنُ ثَوْرٍ، عَنْ مَعْمَرٍ، عَنِ ابْنِ حُنَيْنٍ، عَنْ صَفِيَّةَ بِنْتِ شَيْبَةَ، عَنْ أُمِّ سَلَمَةَ، قَالَتْ " : لَمَّا نَزَلَتْ : { يُذَنِّبِينَ عَلَيْهِنَّ مِنْ جَلَابِيبِهِنَّ } [الأحزاب] 59 : ، حَرَجَ نِسَاءَ الْأَنْصَارِ كَأَنَّ عَلَى رُؤُوسِهِنَّ الْعُرْبَانَ مِنَ الْأَكْسِيَّةِ"

Zainuddin. These contents discuss women who wear perfumes that can arouse male lust, then they are categorized as the *ḡāmiyah* (prostitute). This is because when men are attracted to the women wearing perfume, then it will cause adultery of the eyes. However, there are exceptions for perfumes which are meant to eliminate women's body odor, and not to the point of spreading a fragrant scent that may attract people's attention.

As for the hadith that becomes the basis of the above contents is found in the narration of Imam Ahmad: 18 757, 18879, 18912 (Asy-Syaibaniy, 1993); Abu Daud: 4173 (As- Sijistaniy, n.d); Name of al-Nasa'i: 9361 (An-Nasa'i, 2001).⁸ The hadith has the degree of *sahih al-* isnad, but textually, the hadith can not be separated from its historical context. The hadith does not have a specific *asbab al-wurud*, but what needs to be emphasized here is that the hadith has a *maqashid* to keep women from incidents that may cause her dangers. This is because back in the Jahiliya period, mean people go out at night and they would wait for women to be harassed. So the context of the hadith does not forbid women to use perfume, but it forbids women to go out at night as it will cause a greater danger for the women themselves (Masyhuda, 2020, 70–71).

The narrative described by Manhaj Salaf's account is quite sensitive and provocative. One of their narratives gives a very bad label to women who wear perfume. In one of the contents, they stated "*Sister, don't let yourself to be considered as -sorry- prostitute and your prayers are rejected because of your perfume*". Narrative like this falls into the category of discrimination with stereotypes and verbal violence. The labeling as a "prostitute" comes from the the word adultery in the hadith. The labeling creates a negative stereotype for women who wear perfume. In fact, the perfume used by every woman today is not meant to attract men's lust. The hadith states that human beings are obliged to protect each other from bad things, and not to give bad stereotypes to others.

⁸ حَدَّثَنَا مُسَدَّدٌ حَدَّثَنَا يَحْيَىٰ أَخْبَرَنَا ثَابِتٌ بْنُ عُمَارَةَ حَدَّثَنِي عُنَيْنٌ بْنُ قَبِيْسٍ عَنْ أَبِي مُوسَىٰ
عَنْ النَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ قَالَ إِذَا اسْتَعْظَرْتُ الْمَرْأَةُ فَمَرَّتْ عَلَى الْقَوْمِ لِيَجِدُوا رِيحَهَا فَهِيَ كَذَا
وَكَذَا قَالَ قَوْلًا شَدِيدًا

Hadith about the Women of Bani Israel Wearing Shoes of a Wooden Block

The fifth hadith about the existence of women is a hadith that depicts the behavior of the woman of Bani Israel who used to be insecure of her short height, and decided to make shoes of a wooden block. The narrative was spread through Manhaj Salaf's *Channel Group* Telegram broadcast and its Instagram account entitled "*It is Haram for Women to Wear High Heels*". The prohibition on wearing these high heels was based on several reasons: first, wearing sandals was the custom of Jewish women and was the cause of the destruction of the Jewish people; second, it is one of the practices of *tabarruj* (wearing excessive dress to attract others' attention); third, there is an element of deceiving. The reason is based on the meaning of several hadith texts about the story of the women from Bani Israil, the verses of the Qur'an: QS al-Ahzab: 33, and the hadith about the prohibition to deceive (Salaf, 2020).⁹

The hadith included in the *broadcast message* comes from the narration of Ibn Hibban, no: 5592 which was authenticated by al-Albaniy. The hadith actually explains a woman from Bani Israel who was not confident with her short height, and made a pair shoes from a wooden block to be on par with two other taller women (Al-Tamimiy, 1988). The narration conveyed by the Prophet is the habit of the woman from Bani Israil who wanted to look tall. This, of course, cannot be the legitimacy of prohibiting women on wearing high heels. There is no prohibition or threats to the woman of Bani Israil who wore wooden shoes. Meanwhile, the threat conveyed by the Manhaj Salaf account is legitimating the prohibition based on *tasyabbuh*, *tabarruj*, and an act of deceiving. Thus, the hadith should be interpreted in the realm of culture. The habit of the women from Bani Israil cannot be standardized and applied to all Muslim women.

The narrative formed by the Salaf Manhaj Account has a tendency to discriminate by giving negative labels towards women (stereotypes).

9 Broadcast of Telegram Channel Manhaj Salaf, shared on 23 June 2020.

This can be seen from the narrative, “ It is obvious that if Muslim women wear high heels, it means they perform *tasyabuh* (resembling a lifestyle) of the people whom Allah has destroyed “. There are two discriminations in this regard, *first* , considering that the women of Bani Israil are the source of destruction to their civilization. *Second*, today’s women who wear *high heels* are considered the same as women who bring destruction. The use of *high heels* today is not necessarily a form of *tasyabbuh* with the Bani Sirail, if it is called *tasyabbuh*, then it is included in the category of *tasyabbuh* that is allowed. However, women who wear *high heels* today must be viewed from *maqashid* perspective, because the purpose of women wearing high heels is to raise self -confidence. and this is included in the category of *hifẓ al-nafs*.

Hadith on What is Best for Women

The sixth hadith that forms the basis of the Manhaj Salaf’s account in narrating the existence of women is the hadith “The Prophet’s honor to Fathimah”. The hadith is contained in one piece of content entitled “*A Woman is Better to Stay hidden*“. In their narration, they explain the story of Ali bin Abi Talib who was asked by the Prophet about what is best for women. The question was then directed to Fatima and in she replied that the best thing for women is not to see men, and not to be seen by men. This hadith then become a basis of satire narration to women today who often show their existence by taking *selfies* on social media. However, there is no specific statement in the hadith that mentions the best woman is the one who is hidden.

The hadith used by the Manhaj Salaf account comes from the history of Ibn Abi al-Dunya with the quality of the *t siqqah* narrators.¹⁰ However, even though the hadith is valid, the understanding of Manhaj Salaf’s account needs to be reviewed as it limits the movement of women.

¹⁰ حَدَّثَنِي أَبِي، حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ يَزِيدَ الْوَاسِطِيُّ، حَدَّثَنَا الْعَوَامُ بْنُ حَوْشِبٍ، قَالَ: بَلَغَنِي أَنَّ عَلِيًّا، قَالَ: سَأَلَنِي رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ عَنْ نِسَاءٍ قَالَ: «أَيُّ شَيْءٍ خَيْرٌ لِلنِّسَاءِ؟» «فَلَمْ أَدْرَ مَا أَقُولُ فَذَكَرْتُ ذَلِكَ لِفَاطِمَةَ فَقَالَتْ: أَلَا قُلْتَ لَهُ: خَيْرٌ لِلنِّسَاءِ أَنْ لَا يَرَيْنَ الرِّجَالَ وَلَا يَرُوْنَهُنَّ، قَالَ: فَذَكَرْتُ قَوْلَ فَاطِمَةَ لِلنَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ فَقَالَ: «إِنَّهَا بِضِعَّةٍ مِنِّي رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهَا»

The hadith emerged from the figure of Fatima who was the family of the Prophet, so the consequence was that the hadith was only for Fatima and *Umm al-Mu'minin* (the wives of the Prophet). In addition, the narration that was conveyed was not from the Prophet, but was delivered by Fatima which was then responded by the Prophet, that Fatimah was part of his life, and that everything said by Fatima also represented the words of the Prophet. Thus, this hadith does not apply to other female companions of the Prophet, because they were not involved in the narration and they do not become *kitab* in the hadith. This means that the hadith cannot be used to legitimate the standardization of women.

The understanding raised by the Manhaj Salaf Account tends to limit the space for women to appear in public spaces. It is proved by the narration "*Then what about us today, in fact, many of us prefer to appear in public to stay exist.. take a few selfies.. upload!*". Indirectly, the narrative conveyed by the account discriminates against women with verbal violence as it can hurt women psychologically. The narrative will also have a crucial impact on the development of women's potential in the public sphere. In addition, this is contrary to the spirit of equality (*al-musaawah*) in the Qur'an, if men can reveal their existence, so can women. Like men, women also have the same opportunity to play a role in the public sphere. The opinion appears in public should not discriminate, but encourage women to be better by developing their potential outside of the house. Aisyah as the wife of the Prophet also did not limit herself to the domestic realm, but she played a major role in the process of transmitting hadith whose recipients were male companions of the Prophet.

From some of the examples above, the author concludes that the gender construction of the Manhaj Salaf Account still has a fairly dominant bias. 6 examples of hadith that are used as basic arguments are understood literally and subjectively. Literal in the aspect of understanding diction which is not developed by analysis of language and context, while its subjectivity in presenting opinions on hadith, always refers to al-Utsaimin, Ibn Baaz, and other *ustadz* without considering other scholars who have

different opinions. Literal meaning makes a hadith unable to develop to respond to the problems of modern times, even though both the Qur'an and hadith play an important role in providing progressive solutions to the lives of Muslims, especially in Indonesia. (Najwah, 2017, 201). Referral subjectivity is seen when the source of the opinion is only from scholars of their own circle such as al-Utsaimin, Ibn Baz, and al-Albaniy and no further critical study afterwards. The manhaj salaf account does not carry out a historical search of the hadith and the context within the hadith, so it causes the understanding of hadith tends to be stagnant and does not provide a solution and progressive meaning.

The textuality and subjectivity mentioned above confirms that Manhaj Salaf's account tends to discriminate against women. This affirmation is from narratives that contain stereotypes about women. Women in some of the content above, are still positioned as objects and given a negative label. Women are not given the space to move freely to show their existence as human beings. Women are still considered as sinful creatures and the sources of sin for men.

In Althusser's Theory, every object narrated by the media always has ideological interests. In addition, the selection of words can also describe the ideology of the disseminator of the discourse (Eriyanto, 2011, 13–15). In this case, by looking at the narrative shared by Manhaj Salaf's account, there is an ideological interest hidden behind it, specifically the purpose of the Salafist group in spreading their ideology.

Implications of the Hadith Content about the Existence of Women towards Social Media Users

The movement of the Manhaj Salaf account has a great influence in terms of da'wah. The presence of the Manhaj Salaf account makes religious knowledge quite easy to consume. With a large number of followers, such as their Instagram account that reaches 93,100, the Telegram Channel Group which consists of 45,600 members, and as

many as 39,667 Facebook users, it is easy for this account to disseminate their understanding of Islam.¹¹ This important role of the Manhaj Salaf account has both positive and negative implications.

New Face of Mediatization of the Prophet's Word

The discourse of mediatization and mediation ¹²has become a new topic in the development of communication. The study of mediatization was initiated by Krotz (2001), Schulz (2004), and Hjarvard (2004). Studies of mediation and mediatization are often connected, and even equated, even though the two entities are different. Mediatization is a transformation process that involves text and advances in media technology. The scope of the mediatization study has a more specific realm than the mediation study. Mediatization is defined as the process of interaction between cultural institutions and social culture which is influenced by technological developments. Mediatization studies are often used to analyze changes in social interaction in modern society. The transformation of media results in the dynamic changes in social relations. Studies on mediatization specifically examine areas that occur in society, such as politics, religion, conflict, education, and knowledge (Fatmawati, 2016, 113–15; Qudsy, Abdullah, and Pabbajah, 2021, 94–95).

Mediatization of the words of the Prophet today has undergone changes. In the past, not everyone can easily convey the words of the Prophet, as they realized that they were lacking in capacity and authority in conveying the words of the Prophet. The words of the Prophet are not easy to be re-consumed by the community, because it is only the *kyai* or *ustadz* who has the authority to transfer the words of the Prophet. As time passes, social media has now become a new form in spreading the

11 Last accessed on October 3, 2021, 12.12 WIB.

12 Mediation discourse generally defines how the communication process takes place in a media technology. This study focuses on how technology works to convey messages. In addition, this study also focuses on asking the reader to understand the symbols shared by the media.

words of the Prophet. Some people believe that if the authorized people are the only ones who can convey the words of the Prophet, then the words of the Prophet can not be delivered to the modern society. Due to this matter, everyone competes in conveying religious narratives, especially related to the words of the Prophet.

The role of social media as a new medium in conveying religion is sufficient to provide effectiveness for people who want to learn religion. For modern people who are busy with their office works, *smartphone technology* is the main weapon to access the words of the Prophet. *Smartphones* are a means to access memes, religious accounts, religious articles, and videos of religious lectures (Halim, 2018). Thus, the effectiveness is related to the significant reduction in time. One does not need to spend hours studying religion. In addition, technological developments have also become the main solution for geographical issue (Pangestu, 2021, 76–77; See also Sadly 2018, 45–46) one of which is its touch with courage-based social media. Apart from optimizing the propagation material that is disseminated, it has also become an interesting topic in discussions of the development of modern dakwah. In this case, content framing (framing.¹³ For instance, people in Java, who want to study religion in Sumatra, then they could simply click on their smartphone and they will find anything they are looking for. Therefore, the Manhaj Salaf Account has an influence in the new form of da'wah, and that da'wah is not only consumptive, but also productive.

Providing Religious Insights for Social Media Users

The new form offered by the Manhaj Salaf Account also has an influence on one's religious knowledge. For those who do not have the capacity for religious knowledge since their early age, but growing up

¹³ There are several effectiveness of da'wah on social media: 1) Economic effect which increases the popularity of advertising. 2) Social effects, which can increase the social status of people who post religious content on social media. 3) The viewing effect, in this case the Ustaz needs to re-observe on who his audience is.

with a passion in learning religion, they will try to search for religious knowledge instantly. These people will try accessing religious content on social media. Content on social media is not only a means of da'wah for the account administrators, but it is also a form of contribution. The author classifies these contributions into several parts, *first*, a contribution to religious knowledge. *Second*, a contribution to salvage others, and *third*, a contribution to increase self-consistency.

The first contribution is to increase knowledge for content readers, whether they are commenting directly or by asking questions. This can be seen from the post "Prohibition of Wearing High Heels". In that post, the account @dewikurniasih4379 asked about a different type of high heels, the ones with the raised heels from front to back. Then the @alairnes account responded: "It's the *same as tricking height*"; " *You still want to look tall*". The comment was then responded to by the account @dewikurniasih4379: " *syukron jazakallahu khair for your answer*". The second contribution is to help friends to be aware of the law regarding wearing *high heels*, this was done by @galuhsasmitaa.s account which marked the @ritatyass account with a crying expression, then the @ritatyass account responded: " *it's okay*"; " *Thank God.*" The third contribution is to emphasize self-consistency, this is done by the @elsera19 account: "Thank *God I don't like high heels*". The user of the account emphasized that she never likes wearing *high heels*, so the meme strengthens her principles. These positive implications are the indirect effects done by Manhaj Salaf's account. Therefore Manhaj Salaf's account continues to exist to spread da'wah on social media.

Verbal Violence On Social Media

Verbal violence is the dominant negative implication when observing the content of Manhaj Salaf's account. Violence is not only physical, but also non-physical. Physical violence has a negative effect on others, causing the victim to experience physical pain or even fatal injury. Meanwhile, the non-physical violence is characterized by symbols to

make people uncomfortable and psychologically hurt (Putri, Sudarsono, and Wardani 2021, 35). *Verbal violence* is then also classified into several typologies, including: *direct*, *indirect*, *repression*, and *alienative* (Baryadi 2012, 38).¹⁴

In its posts about the existence of women on Manhaj Salaf's account, especially in the Instagram platform, the account carried out verbal violence which is included in alienative typology because it removes the rights for women to appear in public. In addition, the account also uses words that tend to isolate, limit movement, and exclude one entity from the community. This is what Manhaj Salaf's account does when it provides views on women. An example is from its meme that says: "*Your photo can be a source of sin*". In this post, this account argues that women do not have the right to upload their photos. In addition, the account also provides a *framing* which considers women as the source of sin. If women try to show their existence, then they will potentially cause greater sins. It does not stop here, verbal violence also occurs in the comment section of the post. Some accounts commented with negative labeling against the will of the salaf by labeling the account as "; *wahaboy*"; *wahablon* " ¹⁵by account @exxindro This comment falls into the category of indirect verbal *violence* as it hurts other groups with negative labeling .

Stereotypes of Female Identity

Stereotypes or commonly referred to as stigmatization are also the influence of the content distributed by the Manhaj Salaf account. Contents related to the existence of women has become a media of stigmatization

¹⁴ *Direct Violence* in the form of activities that are carried out directly to the victim, whether in the form of murder, ill-treatment, or torture. *Indirect Violence* includes verbal crimes that do not affect the victim directly, but are carried out through the media, slander, stereotypes, and stigmatization. *Repressive Violence* removal of rights, in the form of not being protected from accidents and violence that violates human rights. *Alienative Violence* , the removal of rights on human roles in one community, restrictions on movement, and exclude from a community.

¹⁵ 'Wahaboy' and 'wahablon' are expressions of ridicule and prejudiced towards the Wahhabi group.

for the account itself and the audience of the content. Stereotypes occur because the society fails to distinguish the roles of women, the ones given by the God to be the nature of women such as breastfeeding and childbirth and the ones attributed by society such as things related to domestic sphere. (Rosyidah and Nurwati, 2019, 12-13).

In their post related to hadiths about women as aurat, women are often considered as objects with no virtues. Women's activities are limited based on the Prophet's words "Women are aurah". This has intrigued comments from social media users. For example, a comment from the @mumtasky account: *"May Allah always protect the brothers and sisters* who never upload photos to social media. Let's just imagine if the uploaded photo is used by some random men to fantasize and do immoral things, the sins will continue forever."*. The account emphasizes that women will always be the source of sin for men, and advises to be careful in revealing their existence. These comments are clear evidences that the contents uploaded by Manhaj Salaf's account have considerable impacts for stereotyping women.

Religious Group Identity Contest

The emergence of content that narrates about the Qur'an or hadith also affects the ideology and the way people think. Posts that have provocative narratives will be responded by netizens who come from different backgrounds. This is due to the background of the person sharing the contents which is shown through his understanding of the verses of the Qur'an and hadith. Social media today is a bridge to form religious identity (Syahridawaty and Qudsy, 2019, 33). So it is not surprising that there are specific languages used to emphasize the religious identity of a particular group on social media, such as: Ahlusunnah, Ahlul Bid'ah, Wahhabis, Salafis, Kadrun, and Atheists.

The content explored by Manhaj Salaf's account is a place for social media users. The Manhaj Salaf account proclaimed itself as *Ahlussunah* and the sender of the Prophet 's messages. This affects social media users

in the comment sections. For example, in the content “ *Most of the followers of Dajjal are women* ”, the account @nunu7p commented: “ *It’s only natural that you recite the Koran with Ustadz Salafi, so the students are mostly salafikair (misguided thought). Surely you have never read Ibn Taymiyyah’s fatwa was also has a special dhiker and even shares bid’ah* ”. Even though the comments do not indicate a direct identity, the account has a tendency to defend one group, namely the anti-salafi group:

The account @muhammad_khair12472cos1 did the same thing, the account commented: “ *Kadrun! the admin is kadrun*”; “ *Wahhabi! May you be guided! Labbayka, Husein!* From these comments, actually the contestation of religious identity also occurs on social media, the group justifies that the administrator of the Manhaj Salaf account is linked to Wahhabi. These comments show that there is a disagreement between a group that has its own identity and the administrator of the content creator who also has their own religious identity. This illustrates that social media users, both content creators and content users, have different ideologies, they contest each other, have dialogues, and sometimes even attack each other.

Conclusion

Manhaj Salaf’s account gives its own color in exploring hadith content on social media, especially studies related to the existence of women in the public sphere. Although it is quite influential on social media, Manhaj Salaf’s account in understanding religious texts tends to be textual and subjective. This then resulted in the construction of gender tends to be biased and discriminatory. In this case, the discrimination carried out by Manhaj Salaf’s account is in the form of stereotypes such as negative labeling on women’s identities. The content presented by Manhaj Salaf’s account has enough implications, either positive or negative. The positive implication given is the emergence of mediatization of the contents of the Prophet’s hadith, especially regarding women’s studies. This account also provides additional religious insight for social media users. The negative

implications of these contents include the emergence of verbal violence, stereotypes for women, and the emergence of unhealthy religious identity contestations.

References

- Abd al-Muhsin, bin Hamad bin Abd al-Muhsin bin Abdillah bin Hamad al-'Ibad al-Badr. t.t. *Syarh Sunan Abi Dawuud*.
- Abdul Kodir, Faqihuddin. 2019. *Qira'ah Mubadalah*. Yogyakarta: IRCiSoD.
- Adz-Dzahabiy, Abu Abdillah Muhammad bin Ahmad bin Utsman bin Qaymaz. 1997. *Siyar A'lam an-Nubala'*. Beirut: Daar al-Fikr.
- Al-Tamimiy, Muhammad bin Hibban bin Ahmad bin Hibban bin Muadz bin Ma'bad. 1988. *Al-Ihsan fi Taqrib Sahib ibn Hibban*. Beirut: Muassasah Ar-Risalah.
- An-Nasa'i, Abu Abdurrahman Al-Khurasaniy. 2001. *Sunan al-Kubra An-Nasa'i*. Beirut: Muassasah Risalah.
- As-Sijistaniy, Abu Dawud Sulaiman Al-Asy'ats. t.t. *Sunan Abi Dawud*. Beirut: Maktabah Al-'Ashriyyah.
- Astuti, Yanti Dwi. 2016. "MEDIA DAN GENDER (Studi Deskriptif Representasi Stereotipe Perempuan Dalam Iklan Di Televisi Swasta)." *Profetik: Jurnal Komunikasi* 9 (2): 25–32. doi:10.14421/pjk.v9i2.1205.
- . 2018. "Kontruksi Perempuan dalam Media Baru: Analisis Semiotik Meme Ibu-Ibu Naik Motor di Media Sosial." *PALASTREN Jurnal Studi Gender* 10 (2): 225–47. doi:10.21043/palastren.v10i2.2679.
- Asy-Syaibaniy, Abu Abdillah Ahmad bin Muhammad bin Hanbal. 1993. *Musnad Al-Imam Ahmad*. Beirut: Daar Ihya' al-Turats al-Arabiy.
- At-Turmudziy, Abu Isa Muhammad bin Saurah. 1994. *Sunan At-Turmudziy*. Beirut: Daar al-Fikr.
- Baryadi, I Praptomo. 2012. *Bahasa, Kekuasaan, dan Kekerasan*. Yogyakarta: Universitas Sanata Dharma.
- Damanhuri, D. 2016. "Diskusi Hadis tentang Kedudukan Perempuan." *Substantia: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Ushuluddin* 18 (0): 1–27. doi:10.22373/

- substantia.v18i0.3410.
- Eriyanto. 2011. *Analisis Wacana: Pengantar Analisis Teks Media*. IX. Yogyakarta: LKIS.
- Fakih, Mansour. 2013. *Analisis Gender dan Transformasi Sosial*. XV. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Fatmawati, Endang. 2016. "Perubahan Kultur Akses Informasi Pemustaka dalam Bingkai Mediasi dan Mediatisasi." Dalam . Yogyakarta: Library and Information Management.
- Halim, Abd. 2018. *Wajah al-Quran di Era Digital*. Yogyakarta: Penerbit Sulus Pustaka
- Hasan, Rianto. 2019. "Partisipasi Perempuan Dalam Olahraga Perspektif Hermeneutika Hadis Fazlur Rahman." *Jurnal Studi Ilmu-ilmu Al-Qur'an dan Hadis* 20 (1): 43–61. doi:10.14421/qh.2019.2001-03.
- Ibn Manzur, Muhammad bin Mukram. 1414. *Lisan al-Arab*. Beirut: Daar Shadir.
- Kodir, Faqihuddin Abdul. 2011. "Gender Justice and Cultural Dimension of Religion, a Proposal to Apply the Prophetic Tradition (the Hadith) in Promoting Gender Justice Among Indonesian Muslims." *Jurnal Kawistara* 1 (3). doi:10.22146/kawistara.3932.
- Masyhuda, Ahmad Ali. 2020. "Analisis Hadis Wanita Memakai Parfum Dan Kontekstualisasi Kekinian." *Jurnal Ilmiah Mahasiswa Rausban Fiker* 9 (2): 60–77. doi:10.24090/jimrf.v9i2.4140.
- Miski. 2017. "Fenomena Meme Hadis Celana Cingkrang Dalam Media Sosial." *Jurnal Multikultural dan Multireligius* XVI (Desember).
- Mukaromah, Kholila. 2020. "Wacana Kesetaraan Gender dalam Meme Hadis: Studi Etnografi Virtual pada Akun Instagram @Mubadalah.id." *Mutawatir : Jurnal Keilmuan Tafsir Hadith* 10 (Nomor 2).
- Najwah, Nurun. 2017. "The Profundity of Hadith Materials on 'Islam Itu Indah' on 'Trans Tv.'" Dalam , 197–203. Atlantis Press. doi:10.2991/icqhs-17.2018.31.
- Nastiti, Nimas Diah Putri Ayu Dewi, dan Syaiful Qadar Basri. 2019. "Konstruksi Gender Melalui Representasi Alam Dalam Puisi Post Scriptum Karya Toety Heraty Dan the Snake Charmer Karya Sarojini Naidu." *Haluan Sastra Budaya* 2 (2): 220–35. doi:10.20961/hsb.v2i2.24926.

- Pangestu, Perdana Putra. 2021. "Efektivitas Dakwah Hadis dalam Media Sosial: Analisis atas Teori Framing Robert N. Entman." *Jurnal Dakwah dan Komunikasi* 6 (1): 67–82.
- Primasari, Winda. 2017. "Konstruksi Gender Dalam Media Massa (Analisis Semiotika Pierce Pada Program Mata Najwa Episode 'Gengsi Berebut Kursi')." *Makna: Jurnal Kajian Komunikasi, Bahasa, Dan Budaya* 2 (2): 136–54. doi:10.33558/makna.v2i2.792.
- Putri, Latifah Rahmadani, Sony Christian Sudarsono, dan Maria Magdalena Sinta Wardani. 2021. "Kekerasan Verbal Dalam Kolom Komentar Di Akun Instagram Garudarevolution Pada Bulan September 2019." *Sintesis* 15 (1): 32–56. doi:10.24071/sin.v15i1.3120.
- Qudsy, Saifuddin Zuhri, Irwan Abdullah, dan Mustaqim Pabbajah. 2021. "The Superficial Religious Understanding in Hadith Memes: Mediatization of Hadith in the Industrial Revolution 4.0." *Journal for the Study of Religions and Ideologies*, November, 92–114.
- Rosyidah, Feryna Nur, dan Nunung Nurwati. 2019. "Gender dan Stereotipe: Konstruksi Realitas dalam Media Sosial Instagram." *Share : Social Work Journal* 9 (1): 10–19. doi:10.24198/share.v9i1.19691.
- Sadly, Effendi. 2018. "Manajemen Dakwah Media Sosial: Telaah Terhadap Perkembangan Metode Dakwah Islam." *JRMB (Jurnal Riset Manajemen dan Bisnis)* 3 (2). doi:10.30743/jrmb.v3i2.902.
- Salaf, Manhaj. 2020. "Haram Wanita Memakai Sepatu Hak Tinggi." Juni 25. https://www.instagram.com/p/CB1ebI_h3zJ/.
- . 2021a. "Ukhty Fotomu bisa Menjadi Sumber Dosa." Mei 31. <https://www.instagram.com/p/CPg5x8JhDG2/>.
- . 2021b. "Jadi Ibu Rumah Tangga Tak Perlu Sedih dan Minder." September 24. <https://www.instagram.com/p/CUM3RvAhHZr/>.
- . 2021c. "Saudariku Jangan Upload Fotomu!!" September 29. <https://www.instagram.com/p/CFiYCnCBq-Y/>.
- . 2021. "Akun Manhaj Salaf." Diakses September 26. <https://www.instagram.com/p/CUM3RvAhHZr/>.
- Soliha, Silvia Fardila. 2015. "Tingkat Ketergantungan Pengguna Media Sosial Dan Kecemasan Sosial." *Interaksi: Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi* 4 (1). Master of Communication Science Program, Universitas Diponegoro: 1–10.

-
- Syahridawaty, Syahridawaty, dan Saifudin Zuhri Qudsy. 2019. "The Contestation of Hadith Memes on the Prohibition of Music." *Journal of Hadith Studies* 2 (1): 23–36. doi:10.32506/johs.v2i1.530.
- Ulya, Nurul Najmatul. 2020. "Perdebatan Peran Perempuan Di Ranah Publik Berdasarkan Hadis Dalam Sosial Media." *An-Nawa: Jurnal Studi Islam* 2 (1). doi:10.37758/annawa.v3i1.200.